This volume is a collection of proceedings of the eighteenth annual conference on palaeography, organised in 2013 by the Comité international de paléographie latine (CIPL). Held in St Gallen, the site of a major early medieval monastic library, the focus of the conference was on the nature, function and specific features of the medieval scriptorium. The resulting publication runs to an impressive 584 pages, with contributions in English, French, German, Italian and Spanish. It is divided into four principal sections: basic issues, a panorama of writing centres (by far the longest section, with twenty contributions accompanied by plentiful black-and-white plates), four individual palaeographical and codicological studies, and two essays in memoriam Albert Bruckner.

Instead of a single long introduction, the prefatory part of the volume contains four very short pieces: an editorial foreword, an outline history of research into scriptoria by Stefano Zamponi, a set of questions on the concept of a scriptorium by Denis Muzerelle, and an introduction by Martin Steinmann, which traces the development of scriptoria in the middle ages. These two to four-page overviews are not as focused as a fuller introduction might have been, but are nevertheless helpful outlines of the complex issues surrounding scriptoria, both historically and conceptually. In fact, this is the case throughout this volume: the reader is left with the impression that the demands of space meant most of the contributions had to be kept almost brutally short, reducing their ability to build an argument; but at the same time their breadth of research and strong conceptual foundation make this a valuable and coherent collection.

The first section of the book, on the fundamental questions raised by scriptoria, explores the issues sketched out in the introductory section more fully. The first contribution by Denis Muzerelle examines the distribution of French scriptoria using the Catalogues des manuscrits datés, a series that runs to nine volumes. He does this using a series of maps and charts, which illustrate the distribution of scriptoria and show a much greater prevalence of production in the north compared to the south. Muzerelle proposes a series of historical reasons for this well-known discrepancy, which are convincing; but he also points out that people wrote everywhere, and that it would be false to imagine that manuscript and document production was concentrated
in a few major centres. This leads neatly to the essay by David Ganz, which asks whether or not scriptoria can always be identified by their products. Ganz provides many examples of different issues related to this question, which include terminology, the role of scriptorium director, the uses of the book and polygraphism. It does not give a definitive yes or no answer to the question in its title, suggesting, instead, that a range of factors should be considered when studying any instance of script. This conclusion is not very clearly put, but it is brought home in the enormous variety of examples throughout. Next, Lucien Reynhout looks at colophons from late-medieval manuscripts, and the vocabulary they use to designate social relationships. Long and interesting transcriptions of colophons are provided. Finally, Paolo Fioretti considers the process by which a scriptorium was formed, using the example of late antique manuscripts written by groups of scribes in small and remote centres, and in lay workshops supervised by Christian institutions. While intriguing, this contribution is perhaps too short and lacks detailed examples. As a group, however, these essays draw our attention to some of the most important and difficult problems of scriptoria: how to understand their geographical distribution; the precise ways in which books challenge a simplistic view of writing centres; what manuscripts can tell us about the collaborative social contexts in which they were made; and how the earliest scriptoria were formed. The essays don't provide all the answers, but they uncover the complexity of late antique and medieval book production in a thought-provoking, if at times frustratingly vague, way.

The central and longest section of the volume, sub-titled 'A panorama of writing centres' (Panorama der Schreibschulen), consists of in-depth regional studies. They appear to have been informally arranged by geographical region (Italy, Spain, France, England, Germany, Switzerland, the Czech Republic and Slovakia). The Italian group comes first. Rosa Marulo presents evidence that the 51 copyists of 34 manuscripts from Vallombrosa, made between the end of the eleventh and the mid-twelfth century, were not confined to the monastery but, like the books themselves, moved around freely in the wider community. Marulo's article effectively refutes the misleading idea of a static scriptorium in which there was no exchange of people or resources, but a longer study would have been more convincing. Andrea Puglia examines the eleventh and twelfth-century manuscripts of Western Tuscany (Pisa, Lucca and Volterra), suggesting that ecclesiastical reform resulted in a structured writing environment which then exerted its own influence. Michaelangiola Marchiaro considers notarial activity associated with the Cathedral of San Zeno in Pistoia, also in the eleventh and twelfth centuries, arguing that the cathedral had a school that trained notaries and scribes who sometimes collaborated. Multiple plates support a strong palaeographical study. Irene Ceccherini and Teresa De Robertis explore four case studies illustrating
cross-collaboration between scribes associated with the Florentine chancery of the fourteenth century and with private corporations, and the intellectual practices behind this. A table illustrating the fourteen copyists and the nature of their collaboration in Florentine manuscripts, together with lists of books associated with these copyists, is provided in two appendices, which are a testament to the large volume of work underpinning this contribution. Donatella Tronca examines the seven late antique and early medieval manuscripts of works by Augustine held in the Cathedral Library of Verona, locating the production of four of these to Verona itself. While Tronca's contribution is important for the history of the Veronese scriptorium, it lacks palaeographical and codicological detail and is therefore not wholly persuasive. These Italian studies overall add to our understanding of the centres mentioned and are testament to the broad range of circumstances in which medieval book production occurred.

Spanish and French studies follow the Italian group. Diego Belmonte Fernández considers two fifteenth-century manuscripts written at the Cathedral of Seville. Using a detailed palaeographical examination, with the aid of multiple plates and images of graphic forms, Fernández convincingly presents Castilian Gothic hybrid script as evidence of new social groups in the context of the cathedral chancery. Charlotte Denoël and Franck Cinato examine the evidence for the existence of a scriptorium at the Abbey of Saint-Germain in Auxerre, and link manuscripts glossed by Heiric both to Auxerre and to Soissons. This article is relatively long, discusses evidence in detail with the help of plates and is an interesting case-study of how to study a scriptorium whose existence is disputed. In the following study, Maria Gurrado looks at the evolution of writing in eleventh-century France using the example of Cluny, Angers and Jumièges. Like the article by Muzerelle, it looks at a corpus of manuscripts from the Catalogue des manuscrits datés to establish an evolution, visually illustrated using maps. It presents a fascinating morphological chronology, unfortunately without manuscript plates but with detailed reference to classmarks. Eleanor Giraud considers the three surviving examples of professionally-produced liturgical compendia under the supervision of the Dominican scriptorium at Saint-Jacques after 1256. Giraud also uses plates and palaeographical details to paint a clear portrait of the people involved in the production of these books, and their collaboration. Robert Babcock and Albert Derolez examine the relatively scarce evidence for the existence of a scriptorium at Gembloux in the eleventh century, in a sophisticated discussion of the codicology and palaeography of surviving manuscripts and with detailed tables summarising the gathered information. Xavier Hermand contrasts individual and community book production of the Canons Regular of the Order of the Holy Cross in the fifteenth century. The well-documented evidence of this order enables Hermand to compare
two different production circumstances, providing a useful counterpoint to those contributions for which such evidence was not available. As a group, these papers form an excellent collection of case-studies of scriptoria, and emphasise the presence and activity of living people as the unifying factor behind the diversity of the surviving evidence.

English, German, Swiss, Czech and Slovakian studies form the final group. Teresa Webber considers the uniformity of formal minuscule at Christ Church, Canterbury in the mid-twelfth century, within the wider context of monastic life. She suggests that this uniformity may have represented a conscious effort that reflected the status of books and their importance for the observance of the Benedictine rule. Daniela Mairhofer offers arguments for or against the Würzburg origin of a set of Anglo-Saxon manuscripts thought to have been made there, thereby sketching an outline of Anglo-Saxon script in Würzburg generally. Thomas McCarthy discusses the influence of Frutolf of Michelsberg on his monastery's scriptorium using an annotated catalogue compiled at the monastery in the first half of the twelfth century. McCarthy's is a thoughtful study of the contribution of an individual to his or her monastery's written production. Marina Bernasconi Reusser offers a stimulating study of both book script and stone inscriptions at the monastery of Allerheiligen in Schaffhausen in the eleventh century, combining palaeography and epigraphy. Ernst Tremp presents a useful update of the history of the early medieval scriptorium at St Gallen. Christoph Egger uses the monastery at Admont to examine the methodological problems of researching scribal workshops and writing schools in the twelfth century, suggesting an identifying feature of Admont books. Egger's is a critical case-study whose problems and conclusions may be usefully transferable. Katharina Kaska describes newly-identified manuscripts from the Cistercian monastery Heiligenkreuz in the Austrian National Library, and suggests that a re-evaluation of the history of the monastery's textual transmission is necessary. Hana Pátková examines the evidence for scriptoria at Bechyně and Kadaň, reformed Franciscan monasteries in late medieval Bohemia whose writing did not enjoy continuation, an interesting if brief case-study. Finally, Juraj Šedivý traces the complex history of the manuscript production in Bratislava in the central and late middle ages, arguing using a range of evidence that we cannot speak of a scriptorium there. This is a very interesting example of a 'negative' scriptorium. As with the previous groups of case-studies, this selection of papers is erudite, and their methodological and conceptual applications are both remarkable and instructive.

The palaeographical and codicological studies that follow – by Dominique Stutzmann on the organisation of a scriptorium and scribal correction, Herrad Spilling on the
working methods of scribes copying passionals, Lila Yawn on patterns of scribal work in Italian giant Bibles and *Moralia* manuscripts, and Dagmar Bronner and Nathanael Busch on spacing in Old High German and Old Irish manuscripts – are longer, deeply focused, expert explorations of single manuscripts or small groups of books that nevertheless offer significant possibilities for understanding the wider phenomena at work. All are substantial contributions to their fields. They are followed by two short essays dedicated to the memory of Albert Bruckner, the first by Martin Steinmann charting Bruckner's life and work, and the second by Beat von Scarpatetti, focusing on Bruckner's *Scriptoria Medii Aevi Helvetica*. They acknowledge the outstanding scholarship and influence of this Swiss historian and palaeographer.

The endmatter is comprised of lists of abbreviations, plates and manuscripts cited, and twelve full-page colour plates. No index has been included, but this is understandable in a collection published in five languages. More seriously lacking is a bibliography, which would have been an important contribution to the study of scriptoria in its own right (though every paper does provide plentiful references). The decision to place English-language abstracts at the end of each chapter rather than at the start is puzzling, and unhelpful, but on the whole this volume is tightly focused, clearly organised and well-presented. It makes a significant contribution to the conceptualisation of medieval scriptoria, making it essential reading for every student of manuscripts. The 2013 conference, and this resulting volume, are particularly welcome for exploring the problems and history of scriptoria in an accessible way, and for bringing the subject, its historiography and its methodology up to date for younger scholars. Perhaps the biggest challenge of this book is its sheer linguistic variety; but, in that it represents both the international nature of palaeography as a field, and an important yet still-infrequent occasion of dialogue, this variety is needed.