Architectural Collaboration in the Early Renaissance: Reforming the Florentine Badia

Author(s): Anne Leader

Source: *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, Jun., 2005, Vol. 64, No. 2 (Jun., 2005), pp. 204-233

Published by: University of California Press on behalf of the Society of Architectural Historians

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.com/stable/25068145>

REFERENCES

Linked references are available on JSTOR for this article:

http://www.jstor.com/stable/25068145?seq=1&cid=pdf-reference#references_tab_contents

You may need to log in to JSTOR to access the linked references.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <https://about.jstor.org/terms>

Society of Architectural Historians and University of California Press are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*

JSTOR

Architectural Collaboration in the Early Renaissance

Reforming the Florentine Badia

ANNE LEADER

The City College of the City University of New York

Designed, built, and decorated to serve its Benedictine community between 1419 and 1441, the Orange Cloister of the Florentine Badia (Figure 1) not only offers a fascinating look at architectural practice in Early Renaissance Florence but also illuminates the role of architecture in monastic reform. The Orange Cloister, so-called since the mid-eighteenth century after some orange trees that presumably once grew there,¹ inspires many questions about patronage, design, construction, and function: Why was it commissioned? How did the building serve its community? Why does the cloister look the way it does? Who was responsible for its construction and final appearance? Primarily interested in issues of authorship, most students of the cloister have pursued only the last question, often overlooking the cloister's architectural history altogether to focus on the Benedictine narrative frescoes that decorate its second-story walls (Figure 2).² Those scholars who have investigated the cloister's building history have concentrated primarily on identifying its architect without addressing issues of patronage or function.³

Despite this attention to authorship, documentary and circumstantial evidence demand a reevaluation of the Orange Cloister's traditional attribution as an early work of Bernardo Rossellino (ca. 1407/10–1464), the sculptor and architect from Settignano who earned his reputation in and around Florence in the middle decades of the fifteenth century. While all architectural historians would readily acknowledge that no building is built by one person, the

biographical model first established by Giorgio Vasari almost half a millennium ago continues to dominate the discourse on fifteenth-century Italian architecture. Those architects not included by Vasari remain unstudied and unknown, and the Badia's account books are full of builders not celebrated in his *Vite*. Moreover, Vasari's one monument—one architect model of attribution does little to address the collaborative nature of architectural design and construction in Early Renaissance Florence. The history of the Orange Cloister provides an opportunity to explore the notion of collective authorship, thereby allowing us to understand Renaissance buildings not in terms of individual genius but as the products of complex cooperative efforts. Clarification of the Badia's authorship issue opens the door to additional questions, such as what significance the architectural object of the Orange Cloister carried for the residents of the Badia, especially for its patron, Abbot Gomezio di Giovanni (r. 1419–39). An examination of the structure's function, specifically its role as part of the abbot's thorough reform of the monastery, enriches our understanding of Benedictine life in fifteenth-century Florence.

Aside from its intrinsic value as a major Benedictine abbey, the Orange Cloister provides a case study that deepens our appreciation for how buildings were conceived, constructed, and used in Early Renaissance Florence. It takes on special importance when viewed as a possible model for the many other Florentine convents that undertook major building campaigns in the second quarter of the fifteenth century,

Figure 1 Orange Cloister, Badia, Florence, ca. 1428–36, view to the north

Figure 2 Workshop of Fra Angelico, *Life of St. Benedict*, fresco cycle, ca. 1435–39, Orange Cloister, second story, west loggia

including San Lorenzo, Santo Spirito, San Marco, Santa Croce, San Miniato al Monte, and Santissima Annunziata. When viewed in the context of the great religious changes under way in Early Renaissance Italy, Abbot Gomezio's project to restructure, rebuild, and reform the Badia stands not as an isolated incident but as part of a broader effort to change monastic life throughout the peninsula.

Throughout the history of Western monasticism, religious orders intent on reorganizing their way of life typically used architectural renovation as a key element of their

reform programs. Architectural structure literally and symbolically served these communities as they worked to restructure their monastic practice. Whether in the codification of space at St. Gall or the innovative designs of the first Cistercians, planners and builders throughout the medieval period created monasteries that would give physical shape to the spiritual rebuilding of their communities.⁴ In the decades surrounding the end of the Great Schism, calls for reform were sounding loudly throughout the Catholic Church, inspiring the Councils at Constance, Basel, Ferrara,

and Florence, as well as encouraging many religious orders throughout Italy to reconsider their approaches to religious life and undertake the Observance, that is, a strict adherence to the order's rules and foundational principles.⁵ In addition to improving the way they pursued their religious calling, these observants also restructured the environments in which they carried out their duties. Thanks to William Hood, the inextricable link between Observance, architecture, painting, and devotional practice at the Florentine Dominican convent of San Marco is well understood.⁶ However, the similar yet earlier example of the Florentine Badia has up to now remained mostly unknown.

The new cloister complex at the Florentine Badia was of central importance to the reorganization of the abbey undertaken by Abbot Gomezio. Indeed, the monastery's interior spaces and their connecting cloister defined each monk's daily routine in accordance with the plans of the abbot, who aimed to reform the Badia by providing physical surroundings to regulate and reinforce the structured life of the Benedictine Observance, which he had inaugurated in Florence on his arrival in 1418. Whenever the monks used their new cloister to pass from one area of the Badia to another, its second-story walls, painted with scenes from the life of St. Benedict, served to remind them of the history, mission, and potential future direction of their community. This article seeks to understand how Gomezio used architectural planning as a primary ingredient in his reform of the Badia. In addition to exploring issues of patronage, function, reception, and authorship, it offers new ground plans that aim to reconstruct the Badia as it stood in the early fifteenth century (Figures 3–5).⁷

Inspiration and Need for a New Cloister Complex

The Benedictine monastery of Santa Maria di Firenze has a long and complicated history. After its foundation in 979 by Countess Willa of Tuscany and its rich endowment by her son Margrave Ugo,⁸ the abbey became a favorite burial and patronage site for Florence's elite families. As the oldest abbey, or *badia*, within the walls of Florence, the monastery is known simply as the the Badia Fiorentina, or Florentine abbey.⁹ This name alludes to the renown of the institution and suggests that the Badia was never far from the center of Florentine consciousness, just as it stood at the center of Florentine life, rising over via del Proconsolo opposite the Palazzo del Podestà (Figures 6, 7). Indeed, it was difficult to ignore the convent, its campanile rising high in the city's skyline, its bells marking the progress of each day, as Dante recounts in his *Paradiso*.¹⁰ Early maps and views of Florence consistently include the Badia as a major

Figure 3 Plan of the Badia as it stands today

1. North monastery entrance
2. Abbey church
3. High altar (former right transept)
4. New choir (former sacristy and dormitory)
5. New sacristy (former chapter room)
6. Orange Cloister
7. Capitolo Nuovo (former narthex)
8. Refectory vestibule
9. Refectory
10. Oratory

landmark, easily recognizable by the angel-topped spire of its hexagonal campanile (Figure 8).

Despite its noble founding, its prominent position in the heart of central Florence, and its status as the richest monastery inside the city's walls, by the turn of the fifteenth century the Badia had fallen on hard times.¹¹ The Benedictine community at the Badia had withered to only a handful of members who neglected their obligations as followers of St. Benedict and as custodians of its monastic buildings, which had suffered from great neglect during the fourteenth century. Such spiritual and physical deterioration resulted from the placement of the Badia *in commendam* in 1327 after which time control of the monastery—contrary to the recommendation of Benedictine Rule—was

Figure 4 Partial reconstruction of the Badia, ca. 1440

1. Torre della Castagna
2. North monastery entrance
3. Monastic buildings (as shown in Rustici Codex, fig. 9)
4. East monastery entrance and east cemetery
5. West cemetery
6. North church entrance platform
7. Chapel of Santo Stefano
8. Narthex
9. Abbey church
10. Sacchetti family towers and houses (converted to guest house and infirmary)
11. Refectory
12. Orange Cloister
13. Monastic buildings (area of chapter room, sacristy, and upper dormitory)
14. Oratory

Figure 5 Reconstruction of the Badia, ca. 1440

1. Northwest cemetery
2. Entrance platform
3. Santo Stefano
4. Campanile
5. North church entrance
6. Narthex
7. Abbey church nave
8. Cappella Maggiore
9. Refectory vestibule
10. Refectory
11. Orange Cloister
12. Choir entrance, Del Caccia Chapel, stair to dormitory and sacristy
13. Chapter room
14. Sacristy

Figure 6 Aerial view of the Badia, north at top

taken away from the community itself and placed in the hands of a papal appointee.¹² Though originally intended to control the Badia and protect it from decadence, appointments *in commendam* led to great abuses of power, with the papal deputies usually more interested in enriching themselves than in ensuring the well-being and stability of the monastery. Consequently, prominent local families no longer found the Badia to be a worthy recipient of their beneficence and looked elsewhere to enroll their sons as novices and endow family chapels and burial sites.¹³ Thus, it became extremely difficult for the Benedictine community at the Badia to maintain its membership. By the turn of the fifteenth century, this old and honored institution was on the verge of extinction. Not only did the community's population fall off to only a few, rather undisciplined members during its time *in commendam*, but also the Badia's conventual buildings fell into disrepair; they are described in early sources as scant, tight, filthy, stinking, suitable for beasts, like a pigsty, derelict, and threatening collapse.¹⁴ Niccolò Guasconi, the last abbot to serve *in commendam*, looked outside of Florence for his house's salvation and found help and inspiration from Ludovico Barbo, who had

initiated the Benedictine Observance in 1409 at the Paduan abbey of Santa Giustina.¹⁵

Indeed, the Badia's troubles came during a period of great turmoil for the Benedictine community in Florence and for the entire order in Italy. Many of Italy's Benedictine abbeys had suffered financial and moral decline over the course of the fourteenth century, including the abbey of Santa Giustina in Padua, whose community had dwindled to a paltry three monks by the 1370s. The decline of this house was arrested by Barbo, who instituted a program of reform based on a strict and close observance of St. Benedict's Rule. Barbo matched the spiritual rebuilding of his community with a physical restoration of its monastery. Once he established the Benedictine Observance at Santa Giustina, he sought to save his fellow Benedictines throughout Italy from ruin.

Barbo sent his protégé Gomezio di Giovanni to Florence in 1418 with sixteen fellow reformers to "colonize" the Badia and teach the reforms of the Paduan Observance through a strict enforcement of Benedictine Rule.¹⁶ As part of his plans to renew the Badia, Gomezio envisioned a large monastery capable of housing many more than the sixteen

Figure 7 Plan of central Florence, north at top

Figure 8 Anonymous, *The Burning of Savonarola in the Piazza della Signoria*, late fifteenth century, Museo di San Marco, Florence. View of the piazza toward the east. The Badia campanile is visible at the left between the cathedral dome and the tower of Palazzo del Podestà.

“colonists” who had accompanied him from Santa Giustina. Elected abbot in 1419, he recruited new disciples with great urgency to ensure the monastery’s financial stability.¹⁷ His efforts were successful, and the community welcomed at least eighty-two new members during his twenty-year tenure as abbot.¹⁸

Abbot Gomezio understood that without an orderly, functional, and much larger space, his revitalized community would not be able to pursue a rigorous observance of Benedictine rule. A chaotic and dilapidated house could only engender a decadent and slothful lifestyle at worst, an uninspiring and passionless one at best. Just as the church is seen as the House of God,¹⁹ the monastery can be seen as His workshop,²⁰ and Gomezio recognized the need for new surroundings as a crucial element of his reform program. Contemporary accounts praise Gomezio not for the spiritual initiatives he enforced but rather for his tangible reforms in membership and architectural structure. As his mentor, Barbo, would proudly report: “Gomezio embellished that monastery very much, enlarging the number of monks and beautiful buildings.”²¹ In order to accommodate his resurgent community, a new monastic complex was designed to stand around an open, three-story cloister that provided sanctuary from the outside world as well as passage to the abbey’s church, chapter room, refectory, dormitory, guest quarters, and infirmary—separate and specific spaces all required by Benedictine Rule (see Figures 1, 4, 5). The cloister formed the nucleus of these spaces, which were used

by the Florentine Benedictines each day, and its walls carried images of St. Benedict to inspire the monks as they labored in the service of God (see Figure 2). With these murals, Abbot Gomezio sought to ensure not only that his community would contemplate and emulate the virtuous, pious, and ascetic habits of their founder, but also that his authority as abbot would be authenticated and defended. Many of the episodes chosen for inclusion in the cycle demonstrate how Benedict’s effective leadership coupled with his disciples’ unquestioning obedience allowed him to perform his miracles and consequently ensure the success of his order. Benedict appears prominently in his role as abbot, often holding a book to remind viewers that the abbot’s supremacy is authorized by the Rule. With their stress on obedience, the specific episodes Gomezio chose emphasize and validate his absolute authority and autonomy as abbot while also celebrating the Rule, ritual, tradition, and mission of the Benedictines.

The Commission to Build the Orange Cloister

Soon after his election in 1419, Abbot Gomezio initiated a construction campaign that would transform the monastic complex adjoining the abbey church, which required only minor structural repairs.²² An important bequest of 1421 suggests that Gomezio’s plans for reform and renovation were well under way by that time. In his will, Antonio Corbinelli, a member of an old Florentine family, made

arrangements to donate his renowned library to the Badia. It is highly unlikely that Corbinelli would have been willing to leave his prized and sought-after manuscripts to the Badia were it still the disorganized wreck that it had become during the fourteenth century.²³ Indeed, the late-thirteenth- and fourteenth-century conventual buildings proved to be inadequate for Gomezio and his new disciples. They were too small and had suffered from neglect, natural disasters, and deliberate damage during the century *in commendam*.²⁴ Gomezio, Portuguese by birth, shared the frugality and practicality of his fellow Florentines and had his builders reuse as much of the fourteenth-century monastery as possible. The sloping and constricted site of the Orange Cloister posed numerous construction challenges. The compound covered what is now one city block bound by the streets known in the fifteenth century as via San Martino to the north, via del Proconsolo and Piazza Sant'Apollinare to the east, via del Garbo to the south, and via dei Magazzini at the west (see Figure 4).²⁵ Originally, another narrow street, or *chiasso*, ran from north to south between via dei Magazzini and the western façade of the Badia's church to connect via Santa Margherita with via del Garbo and presumably to offer access to the church from the west.²⁶ Houses belonging to the Sacchetti family stood along via del Garbo and the west side of this now-lost *chiasso*. On prime real estate in the old city, the Badia's boundaries were confined to this single city block.²⁷ Such a limited site was an important factor for the design of the new cloister complex, which sought to use the available space as economically as possible while still conforming to the requirements of Benedictine architectural tradition. To do so, the new compound had to provide meeting, dining, and living quarters as well as a spacious and tranquil cloister.

Gomezio began his building campaign in the late 1420s, selling real estate to raise funds.²⁸ He was able to acquire bits of property along via dei Magazzini and engulf the *chiasso* that ran in front of the church to complete the monastery's fortresslike enclosure in the heart of the city.²⁹ While relying on local families and individuals for much of his project's financing, Gomezio, as leader of the Badia Fiorentina and delegate for reform there, should be seen as the project's patron.³⁰ As his first biographer, Tommaso Salvetti,³¹ explained: "The buildings, built by [Gomezio's] own efforts with others' talents at great expense, are believed to have been made by a divine rather than mortal plan. This indeed is the common opinion of those who knew those places previously, how scant and how tight they were, threatening collapse, also how they were of an uneven shape. For when the earlier buildings were totally demolished, the new ones were erected on solid foundations above and below ground, with the most

distinguished and expensive structures all built in its own order and for its particular purpose."³² As we shall see, Salvetti's description does not reflect the reality of the cloister's construction history, but rather results from the success of the Orange Cloister as a unifying screen that masks the composite of used and new buildings behind its loggias (see Figure 1). Indeed, Gomezio recognized that the structured life of the Benedictine Observance could take place only in a sound and suitable structure, and his new cloister brings a sense of order, harmony, and discipline to what had been a disorderly and dilapidated mess. With an understanding of why Gomezio commissioned the Orange Cloister, we can turn to the question of why the cloister complex looks the way it does.

A Description and Reconstruction of the Orange Cloister

Following Benedictine custom, the Orange Cloister lies to the south of its abbey church.³³ The north side of the monastic compound contained an ancient chapel dedicated to San Stefano and two cemeteries that were divided by a low wall and housed the tombs of local prominent families (Figure 9; see Figure 4). Lay visitors could enter the church from these enclosures, and one can imagine a fair amount of daily traffic of those seeking or maintaining patronage rights as well as those coming to pay rent, make deliveries, or settle other accounts. Building the cloister on the church's south side, therefore, not only complied with a centuries-old Benedictine tradition but also separated the monks as much as possible from the busy public side of the Badia. The space in which Gomezio would build his new cloister was predetermined at the north by the narthex and nave of the church; at the east by the fourteenth-century chapter room and a group of street-facing shops along via del Proconsolo, which were rented by the Benedictines to local artisans; at the south by another group of shops along via del Garbo; and at the west along the *chiasso* by some houses and towers belonging to the Sacchetti family (see Figures 4, 5). Gomezio decided to reuse the chapter room as well as the dormitory that surmounted it, and he kept the shops along the Badia's east and south sides that were so important for the abbey's income and financial stability (Figures 10–12). He renovated and built anew where he could in the awkward and small area remaining to him, and the design for a three-story cloister solved the problem of inadequate open space by allowing Gomezio to build vertically where he could not expand laterally (see Figure 1).

The Orange Cloister's four double-story loggias crowned by a third-story open terrace form an irregular

Figure 9 Marco di Bartolomeo Rustici, *Dimostrazione dell'andata al Santo Sepolcro*, 1447–53, Florence, Biblioteca Seminario Arcivescovile, fol. 25, detail showing Badia from the north

Figure 10 Orange Cloister, chapter room façade, ground floor, east loggia

quadrangle, five bays long on the north and south sides, seven on the east and west. The cloister's two lower stories have cross-vaulted loggias that are supported by Ionic columns spanned by shallow segmental arches. Segmental arches are common in late medieval and Early Renaissance loggias and were used to span the openings of the Badia's own chapter room,³⁴ whose early-fourteenth-century façade was incorporated into the east wall of the Orange Cloister's ground-floor loggia³⁵ (see Figure 10). The Orange Cloister's loggia arches are similarly shallow, rising from the practical need to disguise the irregular form of the enclosed space. Not a single right angle can be found in the cloister, and no two bays are exactly the same size. Had the arches been perfectly semicircular, following the classicizing proportions and forms favored by Filippo Brunelleschi at the slightly earlier Ospedale degli Innocenti loggia, their heights would have been radically different and would have resulted in ungainly and perhaps structurally unsound vaults. The different widths of the Orange Cloister bays are much less noticeable under their broad and flattened arches, thrown to span the different dimensions of each bay while maintaining as harmonious an arcade as possible.

Unlike nonmonastic courtyards whose columns continue down to the pavement,³⁶ those of the Orange Cloister arcades are supported by low walls that also served as benches where the monks could pause to meditate, read, or admire the frescoes in the loggias above (Figure 13). A pair of Ionic columns defines each bay, whose individual arches are framed by fluted pilasters and topped by a string course that marks the level of the second floor (Figures 14, 15). A smaller set of pilasters continues the vertical line of the columns and pilasters of the first story to span the height of the second-story parapet wall, which is capped by a cornice. This parapet serves as the support for a second story of shorter Ionic columns, and the sequence of column, pilaster, string course, pilaster, and cornice repeats itself to the top of the parapet wall of the third-floor terrace. The articulation of the loggia façades creates a pattern from the ground to the upper stories with a low wall, arch, spandrel, and string course repeated twice and capped by a third low wall (see Figures 13, 14). The horizontal moldings of the string courses and cornices are punctuated by the verticals of the columns and fluted pilasters. These pilasters create a continuous vertical line, visually joining one column to the next to lead the eye up the façade to the open sky above. A manuscript illumination painted by Monte di Giovanni in 1514 shows that the appearance of the Orange Cloister remains fairly true to the original, despite corrosive atmospheric damage to the stonework (Figure 16).³⁷ Gray *pietra serena* columns, capitals, and moldings relieve the white stucco

Figure 11 Badia, east wing with new dormitory, rental apartments, and shops along Piazza San Firenze (top story is modern, perhaps mid-nineteenth century) and old dormitory, sacristy, and shops along via del Proconsolo

Figure 12 Badia, old sacristy and east façade with shops underneath, via del Proconsolo

Figure 13 Orange Cloister, view toward west from ground story

Figure 14 Orange Cloister, view toward south from third-story terrace

Figure 15 Orange Cloister, detail of pilaster strips

Figure 16 Monte di Giovanni, *Annunciation in an Initial V*, 1514, cod. S, n. 14, fol. 54r, Archivio Opera del Duomo di Santa Maria del Fiore, Florence

walls of the spandrels and parapets and echo the cool classicism made popular by Brunelleschi only a few years earlier at the Innocenti.

While several Florentine cloisters have two floors of open loggias, their second stories have sloping lean-to roofs.³⁸ In contrast, the second-story loggias of the Orange Cloister are cross-vaulted to provide support for an open, third-story terrace (Figure 17; see Figure 14), a feature found in Florence only at the slightly earlier Cloister of the Oblate at Santa Maria Nuova.³⁹ While small, the Orange Cloister provided three stories in which the monks could walk, take fresh air and sunlight, study, and meditate, and the third-story terrace would have provided additional open yet private space to the cloistered community at the Badia.

Florentine cloisters are typically square in plan, offering an open, airy courtyard at the center of a conventual complex. Unlike the Badia, most Florentine ecclesiastical institutions had ample room to construct their courtyards, and a survey of cloisters built before, contemporaneous to, and slightly after the Orange Cloister shows that its Florentine counterparts at Santa Maria Novella, Santa Croce, San Marco, Sant'Apollonia, and San Lorenzo were between two and ten times larger.⁴⁰ San Marco's main cloister was built soon after the Badia's and is the closest in size, with one-story vaulted loggias that are each twenty meters long (Figure 18). In contrast, the arcades of the Orange Cloister enclose an irregular courtyard that measures approximately nineteen by twelve meters, resulting in an open space

Figure 17 Orange Cloister, third-story terrace, east side

Figure 18 Michelozzo di Bartolomeo, main cloister, San Marco, Florence, late 1430s

almost half the size of San Marco's cloister (approximately 222 square meters at the Badia as opposed to the almost 400 square meters of open space at San Marco)—a spatial deficit remedied by the three stories of walkways provided by the Orange Cloister's vaulted loggias and open terrace.⁴¹

Rather small with high buildings on all four sides, the Orange Cloister has led one critic to liken it to "a large light well"⁴² and another to observe that "unlike the cloisters of the Carmine or Santa Maria Novella, where single-storied ranges of colonnades enclose vast and tranquil spaces carpeted with grass, trees, and well-heads under a vast expanse of sky, the Cloister of the Orange Trees . . . is vertical, intimate, and rather dark."⁴³ Though quite large given its location in the heart of the old city, the relative smallness of the Orange Cloister site must have presented a challenge to its builders and its patron; the pilaster strips placed between and above the columns of each story seem to have been included to enhance the sense of open space within the cloister (see Figures 1, 13–15). As in a Gothic cathedral, the continuous vertical lines of column and pilaster draw the viewer's eye up to the open sky and beyond the confines of the cloister complex.⁴⁴ The resulting space, while not vast, is elegant, monumental, and peaceful. When inside the cloister, one easily forgets that Florence hustles and bustles just outside its walls.

Three openings in the lower cloister's benchlike wall give access to its court, which in the past has been both paved and planted. Its original appearance is unknown, though the presence of a small garden or grassy area would not be unexpected and is suggested by Monte di Giovanni's manuscript illumination, which shows the central courtyard planted with a lush green lawn. What is certain is that the open space did contain the monastery's well. According to a seventeenth-century chronicle of the Badia, the well had become a putrid cesspool by the start of the fifteenth century, and Gomezio was celebrated for its restoration.⁴⁵ As Gomezio's biographer Salvetti recounted: "And where filthiness had been customary, now a sanctuary of God, that is a chapel and a most sacred oratory, is to be seen at the entrance of the lower cloister. What was once set aside for beasts today is established for the servants of Christ."⁴⁶

Even though the Badia has undergone significant changes since the Orange Cloister was built, including a radical reorientation of the church interior in the seventeenth century,⁴⁷ the compound's appearance as it stood when Abbot Gomezio left the Badia in early 1440 can be fairly well reconstructed (see Figures 3–5). The medieval church, sacristy, and chapter room remained in their original positions and had to be accessible from the new cloister. The church narthex and nave bordered the cloister's north loggia, and a door located

in the second bay from the western edge of the north loggia likely also once offered access to the narthex.⁴⁸ This entrance could have served the lay brothers and *famigli*, or servants, of the community, as seen in Cistercian monasteries whose cloisters provided two entrances to the abbey church.⁴⁹ This door also could have had a separate liturgical function for the monks, who on certain occasions would have entered the narthex before entering the church.⁵⁰

The monastic community would have required a door to go directly from the cloister into the choir. A door found in the Orange Cloister's northeast corner bay would have led into the central nave of the abbey church to give access to the monks' choir, but it seems to belong to the seventeenth-century renovations.⁵¹ The original choir entrance was demolished in the seventeenth century to create one of the two chapels that now flank the Badia's high altar (see Figures 3–5).⁵² Originally, the space between the southernmost bay of the cloister's east wall and the right aisle of the abbey church contained a stairwell that led northward to the monks' choir and continued up to a landing where the Buonafede family dedicated an altar to the Visitation and Annunciation in 1376.⁵³ From this landing the monks could have continued to the sacristy, which stood to the south of the presbytery on a level above and to the east of the chapter room (see Figures 5, 12).⁵⁴ A corridor passed southward over a small chapel and the chapter room to turn east toward the sacristy by continuing along the southern edge of the church. The chapel underneath this passage stood between the stairwell cum choir entrance and the chapter room. This chapel was accessible through a doorway in the east loggia's second bay from the north. Its earliest known patron was the Del Caccia family, who endowed it in 1523 with a dedication to Ss. James and Philip. It is described in an early-seventeenth-century *sepoltoario* as "going into the church."⁵⁵ The 1514 miniature by Monte di Giovanni seems to be set in this space, for it is the only logical vantage point from which this miniature could have been painted (Figure 19; see Figure 16). The door that opens behind the seated Virgin Mary likely represents the door that once gave access to the now-lost choir vestibule, stairs, and Buonafede terrace altar. In other words, the monks would have passed from the cloister through a door in the second bay of the east ground-story loggia into the Del Caccia chapel to turn left either to enter the choir at the north or to climb the stairs and pass the Buonafede family altar before turning east to continue to the sacristy (see Figure 5).⁵⁶ The Del Caccia chapel was destroyed in the seventeenth century to make way for the staircase that now connects the lower and upper cloister loggias to the corridor that leads to the new sacristy and high altar.⁵⁷

Figure 19 Orange Cloister, view from former chapel and choir entrance

Figure 20 Orange Cloister, cellarer's cell entrance, ground floor, east loggia

The fourteenth-century chapter room stood adjacent to the Del Caccia chapel on its south side, and the builders of the Orange Cloister incorporated its façade into the third and fourth bays of the new cloister's east loggia by setting its vault corbels into the medieval façade's cornice (see Figure 10).⁵⁸ This façade extends for about fifteen meters, and the chapter room's interior space likely continued beyond its façade for about seven additional meters on either side meeting up with the church's right aisle and the Del Caccia chapel at the north and the cellarer's cell at the south.⁵⁹ Farther south in the cloister's east loggia were two doorways of new construction. The first, in the next-to-last bay, was a rectangular-framed single door that led to the cell of the cellarer, which documents state was built next to the chapter room before mid-1430 (Figure 20).⁶⁰ The second new door, in the eastern loggia's last bay toward the south, was a rectangular-framed double door that led to stairs offering access to the upstairs dormitory (Figure 21).⁶¹ Another rec-

tangular double door once opened off of the central bay of the south loggia, and its form, identical to the one found in the east loggia, suggests that it also opened onto stairs (Figure 22; see Figure 14).⁶² These rectangular doorways are framed with ashlar door jambs spanned by lintels edged with dentils and topped by a pair of square windows that would have illuminated the now-lost stairwells.⁶³ Between the two stair entrances in the first bay of the south loggia's east end stands another walled-up doorway that once led to a small oratory (Figure 23; see Figures 4, 5).⁶⁴

The first three bays in the south end of the west loggia contain windows that opened onto the refectory (see Figure 13), whose entrance was off the northwest corner bay where a door led from the west loggia into a large, cross-vaulted vestibule (Figure 24). A mural depicting St. Benedict Requesting Silence, designed and perhaps also painted by Fra Angelico,⁶⁵ surmounted this doorway and reminded visitors to remain silent in the refectory as required by Bene-

Figure 21 (left) Orange Cloister, double doorway to dormitory stairs, ground floor, east loggia, first south bay

Figure 22 (above) Orange Cloister, double doorway to dormitory stairs, ground floor, south loggia, center bay

Figure 23 Orange Cloister, ground story, east loggia, view south past chapter room façade, cellarer's cell, and dormitory stairs toward oratory door at south end

Figure 24 Orange Cloister, refectory vestibule entrance, ground story, west loggia, northwest corner bay

Figure 25 Workshop of Fra Angelico, *St. Benedict Requesting Silence*, fresco, ca. 1435, formerly located over the refectory vestibule entrance (see Figure 24)

Figure 26 Orange Cloister, refectory door, detail of lintel

dictine Rule (Figure 25).⁶⁶ From the vestibule, residents would enter the refectory through a monumental rectangular doorway that is crowned by an imposing cornice inscribed with the admonition “Silentium” to ensure that St. Benedict’s request was met (Figure 26). The refectory was a large, rectangular hall with three groin vaults, now interrupted by a corridor cut through the first bay in about 1865 (see Figure 3).⁶⁷ Another chamber, which seems to have been added in the early sixteenth century, lies to the south of the refectory’s end wall.⁶⁸

While the arrangement of the ground floor of the Orange Cloister complex can be reconstructed fairly well, the organization of the upper floors is difficult to determine. The levels of the cloister’s loggias do not correspond to those of the interior floors, which have been remodeled several times since their construction. To complicate matters further, several doorways and windows have been walled up. Even though their specific layout cannot be determined, it is clear that monastic dormitories lined the east, south, and west sides of the cloister, and new quarters were built for the abbot along the cloister’s north side above the narthex. The old dormitory remained atop the chapter room and extended east to via del Proconsolo, from which one of its windows is still visible (see Figures 11, 12).⁶⁹ The height of this window demonstrates that the old dormitory was on the same level as the sacristy and the small apartments that surmounted the workshops on Piazza Sant’Apollinare. In order to keep these rental apartments intact, the new dormitory had to be built on a higher level, and the floor level of the dorms built over Piazza Sant’Apollinare and via del

Garbo is therefore higher than that of the old dormitory and the cloister’s second-story loggias (see Figure 11).⁷⁰

The current stairs and entrance to the upper cloister date from the seventeenth century. Originally, a door opened the northernmost bay of the upper east loggia and led into the north loggia where the Benedictine narratives begin and continue counter-clockwise around the cloister. The original choir stairway likely led to this doorway, which would have been rendered useless once the stairs were demolished during the seventeenth-century church renovations. Thus, a new stair and doorway were installed in the adjacent bay in the cloister’s east loggia, and the original door was filled with a Valori family tomb moved from the remodeled church (see Figures 3–5). Another doorway opened off the eastern side of the southeast corner bay, most likely onto stairs that led up to the new dormitory, and may have turned to continue up to the third-floor terrace (Figure 27).⁷¹ With the seventeenth-century construction of the new sacristy and choir, this door was walled up and replaced by one in the center bay of the south loggia (see Figures 3, 14). Four windows—three are now walled up—pierced the lower half of the west loggia wall and gave light to an intermediary story of unknown function between the refectory below and the dormitory rooms above. That these windows were part of the original cloister design is demonstrated by their incorporation into the frescoes painted around them in the mid-1430s (see Figure 2).

Another door existed on the north side of the northwest corner bay, which likely led to the abbot’s quarters along the cloister’s north side above the narthex, to the

Figure 27 Orange Cloister, dormitory doorway, second story, east loggia, southeast corner bay

Figure 28 Workshop of Fra Angelico, *The Miracle of the Poisoned Wine*, Orange Cloister, second story, north loggia, northwest corner bay

dormitory cells along the west wing of the cloister above the refectory, and to the guest house and infirmary behind the dormitory to the west. A passage also led to a staircase that offered access to the third-story terrace. The presence of this door in the fifteenth century is proven by its incorporation into the fifth scene of the Life of St. Benedict cycle, where the artist depicted a fictive gray stone arch to surmount the lintel of the actual doorway (Figure 28).

Building Chronology

While the documentary evidence for the Orange Cloister project is incomplete, a construction chronology can be derived from the extant account books. These records identify many of the craftsmen responsible for building the cloister complex. Unfortunately, no complete series of the monastery's various cross-referenced journals and ledgers survives.⁷² Without either contracts or daily records for the years 1419–35, one cannot be too specific about how the first story of the Orange Cloister complex was built. Nevertheless, the surviving documentary evidence does indicate that the lower cloister and new refectory were built in the second half of the 1420s, most likely between 1428 and 1431.⁷³ A record of 2 July 1429 serves as a terminus ante quem for the construction of the refectory, which is named in a discussion of Sacchetti family houses that stood to its west.⁷⁴ The stonecutting shop led by Giovanni d'Antonio da Maiano received payment for work carried out sometime

between 22 September 1426 and 15 July 1430 on the windows and door of the new refectory, the door to the ground-floor cellarer's cell, and other unspecified doors (perhaps those of the stairwells) (see Figures 13–14, 20–24).⁷⁵ An entry in a *Libro di Entrata e Uscita* dated in the second quarter of 1432 records that 2,593 lire were spent on the construction of the lower cloister and refectory,⁷⁶ an amount corroborated by another ledger that lists the accounts of the various craftsmen employed on the first phase of the cloister project.⁷⁷ The monastery typically paid its craftsmen after specific jobs had been completed, often with some delay, and so the settling of these accounts should be treated as rough guides to date the completion of the lower cloister. Thus, it seems that the refectory was complete by mid-1429, with work on the lower cloister continuing into 1431.

Several craftsmen emerge from these accounts as key players in the construction of the Orange Cloister. At the start of 1432, the master builder (*maestro di murare*) Antonio di Domenico della Parte and his son Zanobi received payments totaling 440 lire for about a year's worth of work, presumably in the lower cloister in 1431. The amount was the second highest paid to any single craftsman by 1432, which suggests a major role for Antonio in the building of the lower cloister's walls and vaults.⁷⁸ The supply of worked stone was monopolized by the stonecutter Giovanni d'Antonio da Maiano (named in the documents as either *lascariuolo* or *scarpellatore*). Before the end of 1432, Giovanni's shop had been paid almost 1,380 lire and had received another 21 lire by March 1433.⁷⁹ The settling of these accounts corroborates the hypothesis that the lower cloister, most likely begun in 1428 or early 1429, was finished by 1431.

Records from the beginning of 1436 indicate that activity on the upper cloister was nearing completion. Determining the start of construction on the upper cloister and dormitory proves to be more difficult. Documents indicate that progress on the abbot's living quarters above the narthex was under way by the end of 1432 (see Figure 9).⁸⁰ Payments to various stonecutters for details such as doors and stairs suggest that at least part of the new dormitory was built by mid-July 1434.⁸¹ Work on the new dormitory's west wing was ongoing in October 1434, when about fifty bushels of mortar were delivered "for the new dormitory over the refectory."⁸²

No records survive from 1435, resulting in many questions about how work progressed on the upper cloister and new dormitory. Much of what is known about the upper cloister comes from the daily journal kept by the monks from early 1436 through mid-1441. Sadly, no daily journals

survive prior to February 1436. Nevertheless, it seems that the dormitory was nearly complete by 1 February 1436, when the stonecutter Bernardo Rossellino was paid 4 lire for work on its main entrance.⁸³ From February through June 1436, the Badia paid for roofing and vaulting materials for both the new dormitory and cloister.⁸⁴ An entry dated 29 February 1436 indicates that the brick-maker Benedetto di Marco had been supplying bricks to vault the cloisters for some time.⁸⁵ Similarly, a payment on 17 March 1436 to Giovanni d'Antonio for "part" of the stone sent by him for use in the cloister indicates that he also had been shipping worked stone to the site for a while. This entry is the only payment in the daily journal that specifically mentions stonework for the cloister, reflecting the loss of records from the late 1420s and early 1430s related to the majority of the cloister's cut stone.⁸⁶ From 18 May 1436 through the summer of that year, the painter Giovanni di Consalvo—a low-level assistant in Fra Angelico's studio—was purchasing pigments for the cloister, indicating that it was being decorated by this time.⁸⁷ The small amount of money documented for painting materials between 1436 and 1439, however, suggests that the murals were begun before May 1436 and points to activity at least as early as 1435.⁸⁸ Finally, the doorway to the third-floor terrace was delivered in July 1436, and the terrace's gutters were installed by mid-October of that same year.⁸⁹

An inventory drawn up in 1441 or 1442 records the contents of the dormitories as well as the *foresteria*, or guest quarters, which were under construction by the beginning of 1440, if not before. Various dates have been given for the construction of the "nuova foresteria,"⁹⁰ but guest quarters were doubtless envisioned by Gomezio even though they were not completed before his departure from the Badia in mid-January 1440.⁹¹ Indeed, lodging for visitors was required by Benedictine Rule⁹² and would have been the next logical undertaking after the completion of the dormitory by early 1437.⁹³ Payments in March and April 1440 attest to work on the new *foresteria* well under way,⁹⁴ and its inclusion in the 1441/42 inventory suggests its completion, at least in part, by then. By the time the inventory was written, the *foresteria* had one large common room, three bedrooms, and a fourth room "up half a flight of stairs, next to the refectory,"⁹⁵ suggesting that these rooms were located in the west wing of the cloister complex with one bedroom in a mezzanine level between the refectory and new dormitory (perhaps explaining the presence of windows along the lower edge of the upper cloister's west loggia), and the rest of the rooms were built adjacent to the new dormitory on the second story. Fifteenth-century door frames, stair handrails embedded in the walls, and a staircase on the

building's second story help to identify the location of the original *foresteria* in the suite of rooms built perpendicular to the refectory and west dormitory and in the area of the former Sacchetti houses—an area currently occupied by private buildings (see Figures 3, 4).⁹⁶

A seventeenth-century description of the monastery (written by the abbot and resident historian Placido Puccinelli) indicates that the infirmary was located in the southwest quadrant of the monastery near the Sacchetti tower, which stood at the corner of via del Garbo and via dei Magazzini.⁹⁷ That the infirmary was at least partially built by 1441/42 is also attested by the inventory that records the contents of its three rooms and kitchen.⁹⁸ Bernardo Rossellino delivered a *cardinaletto*—a hinge or pivot—for a window located underneath the infirmary in August 1436, indicating that parts of the infirmary may have been more or less complete by then and that its spaces were located above ground level.⁹⁹ Additional work on and expansion of the infirmary and guest house continued into the late 1440s, eventually to fill the southwest corner of the monastic compound. Therefore, it seems that the upper cloister and second story of the surrounding complex were built between 1432, when work on the abbot's quarters was in progress, and 1441, when parts of the guest quarters and infirmary were built to the west of the new dormitory (which was probably built between 1434 and 1436). Work on the infirmary and guest house continued through the end of the decade and into the early 1440s. The cloister that fronts these spaces was crowned with its terrace in 1436 and decorated between 1435 and 1439.

Attribution

Architectural historians have endeavored to name a single architect responsible for the Orange Cloister despite documentary and circumstantial evidence for collaboration on the building's design and construction. Even though Vasari did not include the Orange Cloister in his biography of Bernardo Rossellino, most historians attribute the cloister to the sculptor-architect because his name appears in one of the Badia's account books that pertain to the cloister complex. The first association of Rossellino's name with the Badia entered the literature in 1900 with the publication of several documents detailing payments to the young stone-carver.¹⁰⁰ Between February 1436 and February 1438, Rossellino was paid a little over 56 florins, which was likely for work in the new cloister complex.¹⁰¹ Following these discoveries, most subsequent historians have concluded that Rossellino was the architect of the Orange Cloister,¹⁰² even though the documents do not explicitly say so.

Thus, the Orange Cloister is explained as one of the first works in which this well-known Florentine architect manifested his eclectic yet original style.¹⁰³ Rossellino's documented presence at the Badia, coupled with his fame for later projects like the Bruni tomb at Santa Croce in Florence (1444–45) and his design for the Tuscan town of Pienza (1459–62) have led architectural historians to attribute the Orange Cloister project to him.

A few alternative attributions have been made, but they have been rejected, ignored, or overlooked by those who prefer to assign a well-known name. For example, Piero Sanpaulesi has argued that the master mason Antonio di Domenico designed and built the entire complex because in several, but not all, payments listed in the daily journal he is called *capomaestro alla parte* or simply *capomaestro*—the title typically given to a building project's foreman.¹⁰⁴ This dismissal of Rossellino as the cloister's architect has drawn challenges from his supporters, who have cited other entries in the Badia's daily journal as well as tenuous stylistic similarities between the Orange Cloister and the Misericordia palace façade at Arezzo, which was completed by Rossellino just prior to his participation on the Orange Cloister project.¹⁰⁵ The use of decorative pilasters in the upper story of the Arezzo palace and on the façades of the Orange Cloister loggias has been credited to Rossellino's imagination despite the popularity of this decorative feature in numerous Tuscan buildings including the Badia's own medieval church façade built on via del Proconsolo between 1285 and 1310 (Figure 29).

Twenty years after Sanpaulesi's attribution of the cloister to Antonio di Domenico, Eduardo Nunes, a Portuguese historian interested in the life and work of the Badia's Portuguese Abbot Gomezio, analyzed the previously known daily journal as well as other ledgers, correspondence, and chronicles to reveal a more complex and clearer picture of the cloister's construction history.¹⁰⁶ His discovery of these additional account books allowed an expansion of the list of artisans employed by the Badia to construct its new compound and showed that construction was under way by the late 1420s, when Rossellino would have not yet turned twenty-one.¹⁰⁷ These earlier documents, which do not name Rossellino, raised the possibility of a third candidate as the project's architect: the stonecutter Giovanni d'Antonio—a craftsman mentioned in the daily journal of 1436–41 who appears prominently in the accounts that have survived from the 1420s and early 1430s.

While Nunes's arguments for Giovanni d'Antonio's authorship went unnoticed, most likely because the attribution to him was written in Portuguese, historians have tried to reconcile the proposal that Antonio di Domenico was *capomaestro*

Figure 29 Badia, east façade, via del Proconsolo

with their desire to retain Rossellino as the cloister's architect.¹⁰⁸ They have credited Antonio di Domenico with the cloister's initial design as well as with the supervision of its construction crew. Rossellino, they argue, was "an almost equal partner in the project,"¹⁰⁹ responsible for the architectural ornament that gives the cloister its distinctive look. However, the pilasters do not indicate Rossellino's participation in either their invention or their execution.

Such an attributional "compromise," with Antonio di Domenico as the project's foreman and Rossellino as the creative designer, raises an important question: Have historians approached the problem of the Orange Cloister from an appropriate point of view? The assumption that the Badia hired a single architect—and a famous one at that—has never been challenged. Rather than insist on Rossellino's authorship, should we not strive to identify and learn more about the builders and patron of the complex? What was Abbot Gomezio's role in conceiving, inspiring, and overseeing the project? Who were Antonio di Domenico and Giovanni d'Antonio? How did they contribute to the cloister's design and execution?

A fresh reading of the documents allows new hypotheses about how the cloister was built. Identifying Rossellino

as one young worker among many enriches the history of the cloister by enabling historians to uncover the identities of craftsmen who were not ensured fame by Vasari, yet who form a part of the rich tapestry that was the building trade in early-fifteenth-century Florence. Indeed, once we begin to see the Orange Cloister as a collaborative effort, the problem of identifying the author falls away. While recent scholarship has seen some redefinition and refinement of the term "architect" in a Renaissance context, there is still much to be learned about the organization of labor on Renaissance building projects.¹¹⁰ The Orange Cloister provides an example for which new terminology and new parameters of understanding can be employed.

The Badia's account books list the names of many specialized craftsmen at work on the cloister project: woodworkers, smiths, and brick-makers who were responsible for supplying building materials; master builders and their day laborers who constructed the walls and vaults; and stonecutters who provided worked stone to the wall builders and who also installed doors, windows, and other carved architectural details.¹¹¹ During the fifteenth century, building projects often appointed two *capomaestri*, one to oversee stonecutters and the other to oversee wall builders.¹¹² Despite the fragmentary nature of the documentary evidence, the two men who have been proposed as the Orange Cloister's architects, though they have not been accepted as such, emerge as key players. Giovanni d'Antonio da Maiano seems to have been the project's primary stonecutter, and Antonio di Domenico della Parte its primary wall builder. While Rossellino participated in the building and decoration of the Orange Cloister, the frequency and amount of his payments pale in comparison to those of Antonio di Domenico and Giovanni d'Antonio.

A sixteenth-century chronicle records that 4,000 florins were spent on the entire project.¹¹³ The many lacunae in the documentary record make it difficult to determine whether this amount is accurate as well as how the money was spent. Nevertheless, known payments suggest that this amount could, in fact, be correct. Antonio di Domenico della Parte, a master builder working with several assistants, was the second-highest-paid craftsman at work on the Orange Cloister's first phase of construction, receiving 440 lire, or 110 florins, in 1431. Only the stonecutter Giovanni d'Antonio da Maiano received more in that year, a total of 1,401 lire, the equivalent of a little over 350 florins. Both craftsmen, therefore, had received large sums by the time Rossellino joined the project. All three men received money between 1436 and 1438, though Rossellino would never come close to earning as much as his elder colleagues, totaling at most 56 florins for his work on the cloister project.

Payments to Antonio di Domenico continue fairly regularly between 1436 and 1441, totaling approximately 226 florins with additional payments in kind (the monastery frequently gave him grain, wine, flour, meat, and other products). Received on Antonio's behalf by his sons Zanobi and Domenico, these sums suggest Antonio had an administrative or organizational role in later phases of the project as well. As he was sixty-five years old in 1436, it is likely that he supervised the wall builders; whether he had any role in designing the cloister and its surrounding buildings remains open to question. Large payments made in the early 1430s to Giovanni d'Antonio (the eldest brother and leader of his successful family-run stone- and woodworking shop and the uncle of the better-known artisans Giuliano and Benedetto da Maiano) indicate his workshop's monopoly on the cut stone and architectural details for the complex.¹¹⁴ Given the project's scope, it is not surprising that he subcontracted parts of the job to rising young artisans like Rossellino. Giovanni d'Antonio's workshop continued to receive money through the second half of the 1430s. By 1443, his workshop had earned an additional 86 florins, bringing his total compensation roughly equal to that of Antonio di Domenico over the same period. Thus, through the 1430s and into the early 1440s, Giovanni d'Antonio and Antonio di Domenico each earned over seven times as much as Rossellino, who seems to have joined the project in 1435 or early 1436 to work on the upper cloister and dormitories after the lower story had been completed.

Is the question of architectural authorship valid for the early fifteenth century in Florence? As has been demonstrated by several studies on the concept of the architect in the Middle Ages and Renaissance, the term "architect" as understood today did not exist during the period in which the Orange Cloister was built.¹¹⁵ Indeed, the word only began to be used with some frequency toward the end of the fifteenth century, and even then rarely identified the designer of a building.¹¹⁶ As is true of all projects of the time, construction of the Orange Cloister resulted from a complex interchange of ideas over an extended period. Much of the planning was worked out verbally or with sketches—two means of communication now lost to the historian. Extant documents suggest that the Orange Cloister's building history follows patterns illuminated by the much better documented Ospedale degli Innocenti project.¹¹⁷ We know through contracts and other record books that the Ospedale's construction crew, whose membership was fluid (depending on the availability of both work and workers), was administered by an appointed purveyor, and each section of the complex was contracted, designed, built, and paid for in succession without an overarching master plan or rigid set of designs.

It seems quite likely that Antonio di Domenico, an experienced master builder, would have provided solutions to basic design problems as the Badia complex was planned and executed. Indeed, he was known in the Florentine building community for his renovation of the Parte Guelfa palace (ca. 1418–25), and he took his title as *capomaestro* there as his last name, thus explaining his appellation as *capomaestro alla parte* in the Badia's daily journal.¹¹⁸ The various elements required for the Orange Cloister compound would have been established by Abbot Gomezio at the start of the project, while specific construction solutions could have been worked out under Antonio's leadership as questions of execution arose, though always, it is safe to presume, with the approval of the abbot.

Architectural details—doors, windows, moldings, columns, capitals, corbels, and pilasters—would also have been envisioned by Gomezio in a general sense from the project's inception. He took his role as abbot very seriously and exercised the strict authority of his office as dictated by Benedictine Rule. One can easily imagine that he would expect deference from the workmen in his employ just as he demanded obedience from his monks. While it is impossible to determine whether Abbot Gomezio asked for specific materials or details or selected from suggestions offered by his builders, it is safe to presume that the Orange Cloister, in both its arrangement and articulation, satisfied him. He wanted the cool *pietra serena* detailing *all'antica* set against simple white stucco walls made popular by Brunelleschi at the Innocenti, which, interestingly, Antonio di Domenico had assessed in 1422.¹¹⁹ Giovanni d'Antonio da Maiano seems to have been responsible for overseeing the final design and execution of the cloister's stonework. Other master stonecutters, including the young Bernardo Rossellino, provided worked stone for the project under the direction of Giovanni.

Payment records suggest that Antonio di Domenico della Parte and Giovanni d'Antonio da Maiano codirected the Orange Cloister project and should thus share the credit as two of the project's "architects." Without contracts or other initial documents, we cannot know if Antonio, twenty years Giovanni's senior, was in charge of subcontracting work on the cloister to various specialists including Giovanni; or if Giovanni, responsible for the complex's architectural detailing, was given equal or greater responsibility overseeing the project.¹²⁰

Asking whether Giovanni d'Antonio or Antonio di Domenico was the cloister's "architect," however, misses the essence of what the records and early writers reveal. Throughout the fifteenth century it was the patron who was credited with the role that is now given to architects. It was from his mind that ideas for a building's design came. It was he who hired and paid skilled craftsmen to transform his inspiration into a physical structure. Some of the credit as "architect,"

therefore, should go to Abbot Gomezio, who recognized his growing community's need for more suitable living quarters. After selling assets and raising additional funds from local families, the abbot employed reputable local craftsmen to construct the required monastic spaces in order of need, while adhering to the requirements of Benedictine Rule and architectural tradition.

Rather than starting from scratch, Gomezio's builders reused as much of the existing monastic buildings as they could. Thus, the chapter room, the sacristy, and the rental properties along via del Proconsolo and via del Garbo became the supporting ground story for monastic dormitories above. With the church, sacristy, and chapter room provided for, sleeping and eating quarters were of primary importance, followed by housing for guests and the sick. A new wing containing the refectory, surmounted by a dormitory, was built between the Sacchetti family houses and towers along via del Garbo and the relatively small open space reserved for the cloister. The new dormitories were connected to the reused east dormitory in the southeast corner of the monastery. The abbot's residence stood between his monks' sleeping quarters atop the church narthex, and the monastery's infirmary and guest quarters were built behind the refectory and new dormitory above it in the former Sacchetti family houses and towers to the west. At the center of this complex stood the three-story cloister that functioned not only as a means of connection and passage between the various parts of the compound, but also as a unifying façade, covering the composite of reused and new buildings that lay behind it to give the impression that the monastery was a harmonious, coherent, and newly built structure rather than the jumbled pastiche that it is.

Conclusion

Throughout the history of Western monasticism, architectural planning has served religious communities as they strove to structure all aspects of their lives. Florence saw many of its religious institutions reform themselves—both spiritually and physically—in the fifteenth century. The Orange Cloister stands as an early representative of this new wave of reform architecture because it provided the Badia's monastic community with surroundings worthy of its new dedication to Benedictine ideals. As the Observant Dominican community would do at San Marco a decade later, the Benedictines pursued a program of reform, renewal, and rebuilding at the Badia. The institutional, spiritual, and physical reforms of San Marco are well known, but their similarities to the earlier example of the Badia have not been explored. Interestingly, it seems that Cosimo de' Medici's interest in San Marco came only after a frustrating and

unsuccessful bid to become the Badia's main patron. Thwarted by an abbot and an order accustomed to autonomy, independence, and absolute authority lying in the hands of the abbot, Cosimo chose instead to renovate and decorate San Marco for the Dominicans in the same year that the Orange Cloister's construction was completed.¹²¹ As Abbot Gomezio's biographer wrote of the Badia: "These buildings are so honored and lovely in their appurtenances, especially the upper and lower cloister and the cells of the dormitory, very well outfitted and excellently erected for the most high devotion of the soul, that the most illustrious citizen Cosimo de Medici imitated their form in certain details in his most renowned monastery of San Marco in Florence."¹²² As has been argued, most recently by Dale Kent, Cosimo emulated other leading, and often rival, wealthy patrons in Florence. The Orange Cloister, therefore, can take its place as another important example of Cosimo's inspirations, alongside Niccolò da Uzzano's grand palace in via de'Bardi, Palla Strozzi's patronage at Santa Trinità, and the Barbadori Chapel at Santa Felicità.¹²³

Seen in the context of patronal competition, Salvetti's claim that Cosimo copied the Benedictine abbot's architectural reform in his project to renovate San Marco for its newly Observant community takes on greater significance.¹²⁴ While perhaps merely panegyric, Salvetti's statement does find corroboration in comparisons of details found at the Orange Cloister and the slightly later San Marco. Both cloisters have white stucco loggias with gray *pietra serena* accents. The Ionic capital type found in the Orange Cloister was also used for the cloister and library at San Marco (see Figures 13–15, 18). The fresco depicting St. Benedict Requesting Silence over the Orange Cloister's refectory door, which was likely designed and perhaps also painted by Fra Angelico, finds compositional and functional counterparts in the five overdoors painted by Fra Angelico in the San Marco cloister (see Figure 25).¹²⁵ Such similarity of detail is matched by a common underlying motive as both the Benedictines and Observant Dominicans rebuilt their physical environments in the beginning of the fifteenth century as part of larger programs of reform.

In addition to its possible influence on the decisions made at San Marco and other Florentine convents, Abbot Gomezio's reform cum renovation of the Badia stands as an important prototype for later Benedictine reform architecture. As Mary-Ann Winkelmes has suggested, between 1490 and the 1540s the Cassinese Congregation, as the Observant Benedictines would come to be known, developed and disseminated its own style of church architecture specifically designed to underscore its reform ideals.¹²⁶ Gomezio's method for revitalizing the Florentine Badia is

Figure 30 Workshop of Fra Angelico, *Maurus Saves Placidus*, detail, fresco, Orange Cloister, west loggia

Figure 31 Workshop of Fra Angelico, *The Wayward Monk*, detail, fresco, Orange Cloister, west loggia

one that would be repeated time and again by Cassinese houses in the later fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. These Observant Benedictine houses also pursued programs of architectural renovation as they sought to reform their monastic communities, simultaneously purging the order of unorthodox or corrupt practices and out-of-date, dilapidated, or otherwise unsuitable buildings.¹²⁷ Once dedicated to adopting a reformed, Observant lifestyle, each abbey undertook a program of “colonization,” recruitment, and architectural renovation similar to that of Gomezio.¹²⁸

From the beginning of his abbacy in 1419, Abbot Gomezio strove to reform the Badia. During the fourteenth century, the Benedictines there had lost their way within crumbling walls and unkempt spaces. Gomezio realized that the strict and rigorous lifestyle demanded by St. Benedict could not be carried out amid such chaos. Thus, a new, clean, larger, and more functional complex was built, its disparate parts disguised by the screening façades of the three-story Orange Cloister. The Orange Cloister was the nexus of Gomezio's reform—the physical manifestation of his spiritual overhaul of the Badia. It also provided a stage for the display of Benedictine imagery. On the cloister's second-story walls, clearly visible from the ground and third floors, unfolded the story of St. Benedict—the order's founder, father, and most-respected abbot (see Figures 2, 13). Carefully selected examples of his spiritual journey kept the saint's exemplary life forever before the eyes and in the thoughts of the monastery's inhabitants. Specifically, Gomezio chose scenes that emphasize the author-

ity of the abbot, whose autonomy was dictated by Benedictine Rule. Throughout the cycle Benedict appears as a confident leader, a strict disciplinarian, an efficient administrator, and a loving but stern father (Figures 30, 31). These scenes not only celebrate Benedict's exemplary life but also make an unambiguous reference to Abbot Gomezio—the man responsible for saving the Badia from collapse through his spiritual and structural reforms. The Orange Cloister, therefore, provided an appropriate and inspiring space where the Badia's monks could pursue their Observant lifestyle, its harmonious façades, tranquil open space, and beautiful murals constantly reminding them that their monastery was God's workshop, where they were employed to pray and work for Him.

Notes

This essay is based on the third chapter of my dissertation and papers presented at the 2002 and 2003 annual meetings of the Renaissance Society of America. I would like to thank John Paoletti and Marvin Trachtenberg for reading early drafts and Brian W. Breed for his help with translations of the original Latin texts quoted in this article.

1. Early sources refer to the “Orange Cloister” as the cloister of the well (“del pozzo”), of the sacristy (“della sacrestia”), of the chapter room (“del capitolo”), and after the construction of a second, larger cloister in the late sixteenth century, the small (“piccolo”) cloister. Alessandro Guidotti, “Vicende storico-artistiche della Badia Fiorentina,” in Ernesto Sestan et al., eds., *La Badia Fiorentina* (Florence, 1982), 91 n. 156. The earliest known use of the name “Orange Cloister” is in Giuseppe Richa's history of the Flo-

- rentine churches, though without any explanation as to its origin: "Molte lapide, sono state dalla Chiesa trasferite nel Chioistro, già detto degli Aranci." Giuseppe Richa, *Notizie istoriche delle chiese fiorentine. Divise ne' suoi quartieri. Parte prima, del quartiere di Santa Croce*, vol. 1 (Florence, 1754), 204. The moniker was disseminated over the course of the nineteenth century through guidebooks to Florence. For more on its derivation, see Anne Leader, "The Florentine Badia: Monastic Reform in Mural and Cloister" (Ph.D. diss., New York University, 2000), 159 n. 81, and app. 1 doc. 97.
2. The Orange Cloister frescoes have yet to receive a widely accepted attribution. Most art historians credit them to Giovanni di Consalvo, an otherwise unknown Portuguese painter, because his name appears in documentary records related to the cloister project. He seems instead to have been a minor participant, responsible for purchasing materials for use by a larger workshop team in charge of designing and executing the frescoes. For analysis of the documents related to Giovanni di Consalvo and the proposal that Fra Angelico and members of his shop oversaw the decoration of the Orange Cloister, see Leader, "Florentine Badia," ch. 4.
3. For a review of the literature that demonstrates how issues of authorship have overshadowed or prevented examination of questions about how, why, and for whom the Orange Cloister and its surrounding buildings were constructed and decorated, see Leader, "Florentine Badia," chs. 1, 2.
4. Wolfgang Braunfels, *Monasteries of Western Europe: The Architecture of the Orders* (London, 1972), 27–30, 37–46, 74–79, 132–43; Mayke De Jong, "Carolingian Monasticism: The Power of Prayer," in Rosamond McKitterick, ed., *The New Cambridge Medieval History, Vol. II: c. 700–900* (Cambridge, England, 1995), 636–40, 647–51; Kathryn Horste, *Cloister Design and Monastic Reform in Toulouse* (Oxford, 1992), 186–90; Mary-Ann Winkelmans, "Form and Reform: Illuminated, Cassinese Reform-style Churches in Renaissance Italy," *Annali di Architettura* 8 (1996), 71–78; and Terryl N. Kinder, *Cistercian Europe: Architecture of Contemplation* (Grand Rapids, 2002). For more on architecture as a signifier for the structured and separate monastic lifestyle, even if such discipline was only suggested and not actually achieved in practice, see Sandra Lynn Weddle, "Enclosing Le Murate: The Ideology of Enclosure and the Architecture of a Florentine Convent, 1390–1597" (Ph.D. diss., Cornell University, 1997), esp. 15, 24–26.
5. The fourteenth century saw the initiation of the Olivetan order, a break-away observant branch of the Benedictines founded at Monte Oliveto Maggiore, as well as observant branches of the Canons Regular, the Dominicans, the Augustinians, and the Franciscans. On the rise and spread of these observances, see William Hood, *Fra Angelico at San Marco* (New Haven and London, 1993), 15–19, 157; John Van Engen, "The Church in the Fifteenth Century," in Thomas A. Brady, Jr., et al., eds., *Handbook of European History 1400–1600: Late Middle Ages, Renaissance and Reformation* (Leiden, 1994), 306, 314, 325 n. 3; and Francis Rapp, "Religious Belief and Practice," in Christopher Allmand, ed., *The New Cambridge Medieval History, Vol. VII: c. 1415–c. 1500* (Cambridge, England, 1998), 205.
6. Hood, *Fra Angelico*.
7. Studies of the Badia rely on a set of ground plans and reconstruction drawings first published in 1932 by Ulrich Middeldorf and Wolfgang Paatz, who were interested in the second abbey church, built over a century before Gomezio's cloister compound. Because of their focus on the medieval church, the Middeldorf-Paatz plan shows only part of the southeast side of the monastery as it appeared in the early twentieth century. They also published a hypothetical ground plan of the abbey church as it might have appeared in 1310. While crucial to any study of the Badia, these plans are inadequate to explain the entire monastery at the time of Gomezio's renewal in the early 1400s. Ulrich Middeldorf and Walter Paatz, "Die gotische Badia zu Florenz und ihr Erbauer Arnolfo di Cambio," *Mitteilungen des Kunsthistorischen Institutes in Florenz* 3, no. 8 (1932), 492–517.
8. Countess Willa, daughter of Bonifazio, Margrave of Tuscany, and widow of Uberto, Margrave of Camerino and Spoleto, made plans to build a monastery in Florence as early as 967. The foundation date of 31 May 978 is based on a document known as the "carta di offerzione," which states that the monastery's construction was funded by Willa. Luigi Schiaparelli, ed., *Le carte del monastero di Santa Maria in Firenze (Badia)*, vol. 1 (Rome, 1913), 10. Willa's son Ugo is traditionally honored as the monastery's founder, perhaps because of his generous endowment in 997. This mistake was recognized as early as the 1590s, as acknowledged by Abbot Girolamo da Perugia in his "Ricordi della Badia di Firenze," Biblioteca Nazionale di Firenze (hereafter BNF), Cappugi, 256, fols. 4–4v. See also Leader, "Florentine Badia," 133 n. 16.
9. For discussion of the abbey's name, see Giovanni Battista Uccelli, *Della Badia Fiorentina. Ragionamento storico* (Florence, 1858), 33; Walter and Elisabeth Paatz, *Die Kirchen von Florenz. Ein kunstgeschichtliches Handbuch* (Frankfurt am Main, 1940), vol. 1, 264; and Leader, "Florentine Badia," 1 n. 1.
10. The ancient walls ("cerchia antica") to which Dante refers are those that once bound the original Roman colony of Florentia and later the Badia, and the bells to which he refers are commonly identified as those of the Badia. Dante Alighieri, *The Divine Comedy 3: Paradise*, trans. Dorothy L. Sayers and Barbara Reynolds (London, 1962), xv, 97–99, and "Commentaries," 192–93. Uccelli, *Della Badia*, 35; Maurilio Adriani, "La Badia Fiorentina, appunti storico-religiosi," in Ernesto Sestan et al., eds., *La Badia Fiorentina* (Florence, 1982), 15; Marcella Castelli, *I chiostri di Firenze entro le mura* (Florence, 1982), 16; and Alberto Busignani and Raffaello Bencini, *Le chiese di Firenze. Quartiere di Santa Croce* (Florence, 1982), 180.
11. Despite a devastating decline over the course of the fourteenth century, the Badia maintained its standing as the wealthiest intramural monastery through its vast property holdings. According to Brucker, the Badia's gross property value between 1427 and 1438 was an exceptionally large 19,614 gold florins, making it the richest of nineteen monasteries within city walls. The Badia's wealth was second only to the Cistercian monastery of San Lorenzo di Certosa in Galluzzo, valued at 20,670 gold florins. In the Badia's *catasto* declaration of 1427, Abbot Gomezio declared that his institution's annual income was 237 florins; its expenditures, 1,100 florins; and its debts, 2,148 florins. Archivio di Stato, Florence (hereafter ASF), Catasto, 192, fol. 289r. Gene Adam Brucker, "Monasteries, Friaries, and Nunneries in Quattrocento Florence," in Timothy Verdon and John Henderson, eds., *Christianity and the Renaissance: Image and Religious Imagination in the Quattrocento* (Syracuse, 1990), 45, 51, 52.
12. For more on the practice of *commendam*, see F. L. Cross and E. A. Livingstone, eds., *The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, 2nd ed. (Oxford, 1974), 246, 319; Guidotti, "Vicende storico," 67 (see n. 1); and Barry Collett, *Italian Benedictine Scholars and the Reformation: The Congregation of Santa Giustina of Padua* (Oxford, 1985), 1–3.
- For more on the decline of the Badia in the fourteenth century, see Alessandro Cirri, "La Badia di Firenze," *Firenze, Rassegna Mensile del Comune* 4 (Apr. 1935), 109; Eduardo Nunes, *Dom Frey Gomez Abade de Florença, 1420–1440* (Braga, 1963), 33; Adriani, "Badia Fiorentina," 25–27; and Francesca Carrara, "La Badia Fiorentina e la congregazione cassinese," in Gianfranco Rolfi et al., eds., *La chiesa e la città a Firenze nel XV secolo* (Milan, 1992), 105.
13. Indeed, other monastic houses in Florence were able to take advantage of the Badia's weakened position, especially the nearby Camaldolese house of S. Maria degli Angeli. For more on the growth of this convent through professions by the city's elite, see George R. Bent, "Santa Maria degli Angeli and the Arts: Patronage, Production, and Practice in a Trecento Florentine Monastery" (Ph.D. diss., Stanford University, 1993), 58–65.
14. Tommaso Salvetti, "B. Gometii Vita, Autore Thoma Salvetti," Bib-

lioteca Medicea Laurenziana (hereafter BML), Florence, MS. Ashb. 885, fols. 5v–6; Girolamo da Perugia, “Ricordi della Badia,” fol. 4v; Placido Puccinelli, *Historia dell’eroiche attioni de’BB. Gometio portoghese abbate di Badia* . . . (Milan, 1645), 7–9; and Puccinelli, *Cronica dell’Abbadia di Fiorenza, suoi privilegi ponteficii, e cesarei* . . . (Milan, 1664), 34. Salvetti’s biography of the abbot and Puccinelli’s chronicles are key documents for the history of the Badia. Salvetti wrote the biography for the Portuguese infante Don Pedro, Duke of Coimbra. Puccinelli, who was abbot of the Badia for much of the seventeenth century, provides an eyewitness account of the appearance and layout of the Badia before its radical reformation, begun in 1627.

15. Ildefonso Tassi, “Per la datazione di alcune lettere di Ludovico Barbo,” *Benedictina* 3, no. 3–4 (1949), 279; Tassi, “La crisi della congregazione di S. Giustina tra il 1419 e il 1431,” *Benedictina* 5 (1951), 95; Collett, *Italian Benedictine Scholars*, 2; and Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 4–6 nn. 5–8.

16. For the date of Gomezio’s arrival at the Badia, see Antonio Domingues De Sousa Costa, “D. Gomes, reformador da abadia de Florença, e as tentativas de reforma dos mosteiros portugueses no século XV,” *Studia Monastica* 5 (1963), 75–79; Nunes, *Gomez*, 41–42; Giovanni Battista Francesco Trolese, *Ludovico Barbo e S. Giustina: contributo bibliografico, problemi attinenti alla riforma monastica del Quattrocento* (Rome, 1983), 37–38; and Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 6 n. 10.

17. For more on Gomezio’s early career and election as abbot, see De Sousa Costa, “D. Gomes, reformador,” 69–75; Nunes, *Gomez*, 41–54; and Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 6 nn. 11–12.

18. Matriculation records indicate that the Badia took in eighty-two new members between 1420 and 1439, the years of Abbot Gomezio’s reign—seventy-two as monks, the remaining ten as *conversi*, or lay brothers. The number of entrants ranged from zero to nine in any given year. Thirty-three brothers died during this same period, and it is difficult to determine how many monks were resident at the Badia at any one time as the matriculation records do not account for those who may have left the monastery for reform missions or other duties. For the matriculation records, see BNF, *Conventi Soppressi da ordinare*, Badia, no. 5 (str. 4), cited by Nunes, *Gomez*, 110–12. See also Girolamo da Perugia, “Ricordi della Badia,” fol. 10, trans. in Leader, “Florentine Badia,” app. 1 doc. 137. Puccinelli gives a chronological list of professions with ninety-eight names (the eighty-two professions and the sixteen colonists) and some biographical information in his *Cronica*, 118–26.

19. Braunfels, *Monasteries*, 11 (see n. 4).

20. In the prologue to his *Rule*, Benedict describes the monastery as “a school for the service of the Lord.” In chapter four, he refers to the monastery as a workshop. *St. Benedict’s Rule for Monasteries*, trans. Leonard J. Doyle (Collegeville, Minn., 1948), 5, 18. The metaphor of the workshop is appropriate, for not only did the monastery need to be efficient and highly organized, but also each member of the community had important roles to play as workers for God. Indeed, Benedict refers to the monk as God’s “laborer” and repeatedly refers to monastic work and service for God. *Ibid.*, 2, *passim*.

21. “Qui [Gomectius] augmentatione monachorum et pulcerrimis edificiis monasterium illud plurimum decoravit.” Ludovico Barbo, *De Initiiis Congregationis Sanctae Justinae de Padua* (Padua, 1908), 26. Quoted in Nunes, *Gomez*, 48, 109, 241.

22. Three churches have served the Benedictine community at the Badia: the first was built under imperial beneficence in the late tenth century at the ancient city’s east boundary; the second was erected ca. 1285–1310 to replace the Ottonian structure in response to the commune’s new Palazzo del Podestà and its resulting encroachment on the Badia’s property, which by then was located in the center of the ever-growing city; and the third was built between 1627 and 1666, using the medieval structure’s walls as a

shell to contain a reoriented interior renovated in the Baroque style. See Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 133–54.

23. Corbinelli’s decision to leave his extensive collection of about two hundred and eighty manuscripts to the Badia was of crucial importance to Gomezio’s reforms, for the monks could not follow Benedictine Rule properly without a library. Corbinelli stipulated in his testament, first written in 1421 and revised in 1424, that in order for the monks to receive his manuscripts the Badia had to remain under the leadership of its elected abbot and the monks had to maintain the strict Observance of Benedictine Rule initiated by Gomezio. Indeed, it was Gomezio’s reform that won Corbinelli’s patronage. Poggio Bracciolini was astounded when he heard that Corbinelli wanted to leave his precious books to the Badia, but his anger seems to stem from his dashed hopes that Corbinelli’s books would be sold upon his death. For more on Corbinelli’s gift to the Badia, see Rudolf Blum, *La Biblioteca della Badia Fiorentina e i codici di Antonio Corbinelli*, *Studi e testi*, 155 (Città del Vaticano, 1951), 18–19, 51–55.

24. Matteo Villani, *Cronica*, Collezione di storici e cronisti italiani, ed. F. Gherardi Dragomani, 2 vols. (Florence, 1846), 8.6.

25. The modern names of these streets are via Dante Alighieri, via del Proconsolo, Piazza San Firenze, via della Condotta, and via dei Magazzini. For more on the history of this block and the alterations of the street names, see Domenico Tordi, Giovanni Poggi, and Umberto Dorini, *Stradario storico e amministrativo della città e del comune di Firenze*, 2nd ed. (Florence, 1929), nos. 273, 307, 380, 441, 627, 901; and Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 127–28 nn. 2–6.

26. In the early 1420s, the Badia purchased this alley and incorporated it into its monastic enclosure, expanding the abbey’s fortification-like presence in the center of the city. While it is not clear exactly when the alley disappeared, it was no longer in use by the fifteenth century, seemingly closed—as reported by Placido Puccinelli, the Badia’s seventeenth-century abbot and resident historian—in 1444. Puccinelli, *Cronica*, 4–5. For more on the alley’s history and potential reconstruction, see Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 128–29 nn. 7, 8.

27. For more on the relationship between the Badia and the commune during the construction of the new civic palace, see Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 130–32.

28. For various records regarding the purchase, sale, and rental of property, see ASF, *Corporazioni Religiose Soppresses da Governo Francese* (hereafter Corp. Rel. Soppr.), 78, 261, and “Memoriarum,” vol. 1 (1420–1491). “Libro Ricordanze, segnato A, 1420–1434,” fols. 1–45.

29. Salvetti, “Gometii Vita,” fols. 6v–7 (see n. 14). See also Nunes, *Gomez*, 244–46; Guidotti, “Vicende storiche,” 68, 90 n. 154, 163–64 doc. 7 (see n. 1), Carrara, “Badia Fiorentina,” 112 no. 6.7a (see n. 12); and Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 161 n. 85.

30. Vespasiano da Bisticci credited one Ser Filippo di Ser Ugolino Pieruzzi as the cloister’s patron, but there is little evidence for this claim. While Ser Filippo does seem to have played a minor role in the financing of this project, the amounts of money that he may have given comprise only a small fraction of the entire amount spent on the project. Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 161–66.

31. At some time before February 1443, Tommaso Salvetti, who was the Badia’s lawyer and was buried in the church in 1472, wrote a biography of Gomezio for the Duke of Coimbra. Salvetti, “Gometii Vita,” fol. 13v. For more on the text, see Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 164 n. 94.

32. Salvetti, “Gometii Vita,” fol. 5v–6. Trans. in Nunes, *Gomez*, 241–42.

33. The Benedictine practice of placing the cloister to the south of the abbey church was standardized with the unexecuted plan for a new monastery at St. Gall and was made popular in the west after the Carolingian period. Braunfels, *Monasteries*, 27–28 (see n. 4); and De Jong, “Carolingian Monasticism,” 637 (see n. 4).

34. For example, the use of segmental arches can be found in the entry loggia of the Ospedale di San Matteo (1398–1406) and the Chiostro di Sant'Antonio at San Marco (1437–40), both in Florence.
35. The medieval chapter room was in an area bound at the north by the west bay of the south transept and a small oratory dedicated to Ss. James and Philip, and at the east by the sacristy, which stood behind but above the chapter room (see Figures 4, 5). All that remains of the chapter room is its façade and what may be its original floor level. Built about 1330, the chapter room was entered through a triple-arched façade typical of contemporary chapter rooms like that at Santa Maria Novella, as well as later examples at San Marco, Santa Croce, and San Lorenzo. A central doorway is flanked by low walls that carry squat octagonal piers with smooth-leaf capitals. The piers support three shallow segmental arches that crown the door and two windows, which were walled up during the seventeenth-century renovations when the space lost its original function. Puccinelli dated the chapter room ca. 1330 during the abbacy of Giovanni II. Puccinelli, *Cronica*, 26; Paatz, *Die Kirchen*, 1: 265, 297 n. 14 (see n. 9).
36. See, for example, the 1420s courtyard at the Ospedale degli Innocenti, where the column bases rest directly on the pavement of the courtyard.
37. Monte di Giovanni, *Annunciation in an Initial V, Proprium Sanctorum Communium per totum annum*, Florence, Archivio Opera del Duomo di Santa Maria del Fiore, Cod. S n. 14, fol. 54. Charles Mack correctly recognized that Monte used the Orange Cloister of the Badia as the backdrop in his *Annunciation*. However, this identification has gone unnoticed in the literature on the manuscript. Charles Randall Mack, "Studies in the Architectural Career of Bernardo di Matteo Ghamberelli called Rossellino" (Ph.D. diss., University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, 1972), 57 n. 14; and Lorenzo Fabbri and Marica Tacconi, *I libri del Duomo di Firenze, codici liturgici e biblioteca di Santa Maria del Fiore (secoli XI–XVI)* (Florence, 1997), 228–29, no. 85. Monte di Giovanni rented various workshops from the Badia from 1474 to 1515 and probably would have had an opportunity to see the Orange Cloister during this time. Mirella Levi D'Ancona, *Miniatura e miniatori a Firenze dal XIV al XVI secolo. Documenti per la storia della miniatura* (Florence, 1962), 204–6.
38. Other two-story Florentine cloisters include the Chiostro Grande, Santa Maria Novella (mid-fourteenth century); the cloister of Sant'Apollonia (1430s); the Spinelli Cloister, Santa Croce (1448–52); and the first, or canon, cloister of San Lorenzo (1457–61).
39. Mack dated the Oblate Cloister ca. 1420 and claimed that it and the Orange Cloister are the only examples of three-story cloisters with cross-vaulted loggias in each of the lower two stories. Mack, "Studies," 40–41.
40. The Chiostro Verde, built in the fourteenth century at Santa Maria Novella, encloses a space nearly 625 sq. m, and each of its five-span arcades is approximately 25 m long. The Chiostro Grande, also constructed in the fourteenth century at Santa Maria Novella, is rectangular and its arcades enclose a space that is approximately 50 x 40 m, or 2,000 sq. m. Two rectangular cloisters at Santa Croce, one built in the 1380s and the second in the late 1440s and early 1450s, enclose open spaces that measure approximately 37 x 30 m and 35 x 25 m, respectively (1,110 sq. m and 875 sq. m). Each arcade of the square courtyard at the Ospedale degli Innocenti, which dates to the late 1420s, has five arches and is approximately 30 m long, enclosing a 900-sq.-m space. The open space of the square cloister at the convent of Sant'Apollonia, built in the late 1430s, is approximately 2,209 sq. m. The square cloister at San Lorenzo, built in the late 1450s, has seven-arch loggias whose arcades are each approximately 25 m long to enclose a 625-sq.-m space.
41. The following measurements correspond to the parapet wall of the Orange Cloister's second story: 12 m (north), 19.05 m (east), 12 m (south), and 17.9 m (west).
42. Mack, "Studies," 39.
43. Hood, *Fra Angelico*, 130 (see n. 5).
44. Maryla Tyszkiewicz saw the "verticality" of the column/pilaster combination as particularly Gothic in style. Maryla Tyszkiewicz, "Il Chiostro degli Aranci della Badia Fiorentina," *Rivista d'Arte*, 3rd ser., 27, no. 2 (1951–52), 205.
45. Puccinelli, *Cronica*, 34 (see n. 14). The present well is a modern reconstruction of the original quattrocento structure, which was restored and partially rebuilt in 1928. "Belle Arti," *Firenze, Rassegna Mensile del Comune* 1, no. 9–10 (Sept.–Oct. 1932), 91.
46. Salvetti, "Gometti Vita," fol. 5v–6 (see n. 14); trans. by Nunes, *Gomez*, 242 (see n. 12).
47. The interior of the thirteenth-century church was completely remodeled in the seventeenth century by the architect Matteo di Marco Segaloni for Abbot Serafino Casolani. Beginning his project in February 1628, Segaloni rotated the orientation of the church by ninety degrees, resulting in the closure of the narthex and the construction of a new entrance on the north side (see Figures 3–5). The former *cappella maggiore* and choir became the lateral arms of a Greek cross, and the former right aisle became the high altar, with a newly built deep choir extending behind it to the south in the area of the former sacristy and dormitory. For dating and description of Segaloni's church, see Leader, "Florentine Badia," 138 nn. 27, 28 (see n. 1).
48. The door that stands today in the north loggia's second bay from the west was refashioned from the original south narthex entrance during the seventeenth century to serve as the entrance to the *capitolo nuovo*, or new chapter room.
49. Such a "lay" entrance was typical in Cistercian churches. Interestingly, later Cassinese churches would look specifically to Cistercian architecture as one source of inspiration. Winkelmess, "Form and Reform," 71–77 (see n. 4).
50. One possibility is the ritual "maundy" ceremony of foot-washing, usually conducted in the cloister of Cistercian buildings, but also sometimes performed in a narthex. For a discussion of the frequent inclusion of two entrances from cloister to church, see Braunfels, *Monasteries*, 75–76 (see n. 4).
51. Reached by five steps, more than a meter above the cloister floor, this entrance resembles the one found in the southeast corner of the fourteenth-century Chiostro Verde at San Maria Novella. The steps at the Badia are quite steep, measuring between 21 and 24 cm in height to rise about 115 cm. Given its height above the cloister and the absence of any carved moldings or other decorative detail, this door does not seem to have been part of the fifteenth-century construction project.
52. The chapel built in the space of the former entrance from the cloister to the nave is dedicated to the Holy Spirit (see Figure 3).
53. ASF, Manoscritti, 628, "Sepoltuari," fol. 18, no. 101; Puccinelli, *Cronica*, 5.
54. The sacristy was supported by a ground story shop that faced east onto via del Proconsolo. Leader, "Florentine Badia," 149–52.
55. "Sepoltuari," fol. 18; Puccinelli, *Cronica*, 5–6; and Puccinelli, *Memorie sepolcrali dell'Abbadia Fiorentina, e d'altri monasteri . . . Galleria sepolcrale dell'Abbadia di Fiorenza aggiunta al Trattato de' Tumuli, con l'introduzione della divozione di S. Mauro Abbate* (Milan, 1664), no. 31.
56. The monks' choir, which was vaulted in 1529 by Filippo di Francesco di Graziadio to create a second story for use as a night choir, was located toward the west end of the nave. In their reconstruction, Middeldorf and Paatz located the choir in the westernmost part of the nave. I disagree with their placement because both the 1614 "Sepoltuario" and Puccinelli's *Cronica* suggest the choir was freestanding and closer to the presbytery than indicated in the Middeldorf-Paatz plan (see n. 7). The seventeenth-century chronicles indicate that the choir started at the central piers of the nave and ended near the campanile. "Sepoltuari," fols. 4v–6, 15v, 17; Puccinelli,

Cronica, 2, 4; Filippo Baldinucci, *La Veglia. Dialogo di Sincero Veri*, 2nd ed. (Florence, 1690), 18; Uccelli, *Della Badia*, 62–63 (see n. 9); Arnaldo Cocchi, *Le chiese di Firenze dal secolo IV al secolo XX. Quartiere di S. Giovanni* (Florence, 1903), 112, 114; Paatz, *Die Kirchen*, 1: 271–74 (see n. 9); Guidotti, “Vicende storico,” 63–64 (see n. 1). For payments related to the construction of the night choir, see Guidotti, “Vicende storico,” 194–95, doc. 12: ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 361, “Miscellanea,” fols. 1124r–v.

57. This chapel may have been part of the original cloister project, and passed to the Del Caccia in 1523, though it is equally possible that the space was sanctified as a chapel after its construction in the late 1420s. The current stairs ascend one flight to a small hallway on the right that leads to the new sacristy and high altar of the present church. A second flight of stairs to the left of the first continues up to the cloister’s second floor. Puccinelli, *Cronica*, 5, 8; Uccelli, *Della Badia*, 68; Middeldorf and Paatz, “Gotische Badia,” 503 (see n. 7); Paatz, *Die Kirchen*, 1: 275; Mack, “Studies,” 36 (see n. 37); and Guidotti, “Vicende storico,” 65–66, 77, 87 n. 97.

58. The windows of the chapter room have been walled up, and two round openings framed with decorative cable moldings were inserted in each. These oculi seem to be fifteenth-century, but it is not clear where they were originally installed. Mack (“Studies,” 56 n. 8) hesitantly suggested that a payment on 6 July 1436 for work done for chapter room windows could be for these oculi, but the payments refer to marble windows, and the oculi are carved from *pietra serena*. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 1, “Libro Giornale B, 1436–1441” (hereafter “Giornale B”), fols. 27v, 28v. Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 153 n. 69, and app. 1 docs. 77, 79.

59. The floor level of the medieval chapter room, built about a century before Gomezio’s cloister, is several steps lower than that of the cloister, though it is not clear whether this is original or the result of the seventeenth-century renovations. The chapter room’s ceiling was lowered at that time to convert the space into a basementlike storage area beneath the new sacristy, and the medieval narthex was adapted to become the new chapter room. The medieval chapter room originally extended north to abut the Del Caccia chapel. The wall shared by these two spaces now serves as the north wall of the new sacristy. Presuming symmetry, the chapter room’s south wall likely abutted the cell of the cellarer, whose door was in the fifth bay from the north of the east loggia. The depth of the original chapter room is difficult to determine.

60. On 6 December 1438, the *scarpellatore* Attaviano d’Antonio was paid for making the door for the cellarer’s cell “at the time of Don Pazino,” which had to be between 22 September 1426 when this monk joined the Badia, and 15 July 1430, when he died. An inventory of 1441–42 states that the cellarer’s cell was located next to the chapter room. For Don Pazino’s profession and death dates see BNF, Conventi Soppressi da ordinare, Badia, no. 5 (str. 4), fol. 2; Puccinelli, *Cronica*, 122; and Nunes, *Gomez*, 244 n. 10. For transcriptions of the payment to Attaviano and the 1441 inventory, see Leader, “Florentine Badia,” app. 1 docs. 115 and 130.

61. Mack also postulated that the original staircase from the lower to upper cloister was located to the south of the chapter room. This stairway was removed, most likely during the seventeenth-century renovation when the east flank of the complex was restructured to become the church sacristy and choir, and the doors were consequently walled up. Mack, “Studies,” 48.

62. Given the wide variety of stair types in fourteenth- and early-fifteenth-century Florentine buildings, it is difficult to use other examples to reconstruct the Orange Cloister’s stair system. It seems, however, that the builders aimed to provide pragmatic modes of access rather than adhere to strict rules or types. For more on fourteenth-century stair building, see Marvin Trachtenberg, “Archaeology, Merriment, and Murder: The First Cortile of the Palazzo Vecchio and Its Transformations in the Late Florentine Republic,” *Art Bulletin* 71 (Dec. 1989), 589–90. See also Andreas Tönnemann,

“L’Escalier du Palais Gondi et la tradition florentine,” and Christoph-Luitpold Frommel, “Scale maggiori dei palazzi romani del rinascimento,” in André Chastel and Jean Guillaume, eds., *L’Escalier dans l’architecture de la Renaissance. Actes du colloque tenu à Tours du 22 au 26 mai 1979* (Paris, 1985), 133–34 and 135–43, respectively.

63. This door type is found in buildings by Michelozzo di Bartolomeo’s workshop and is classified by Howard Saalman as the architect’s “Old Florentine” type. Howard Saalman, “The Palazzo Comunale in Montepulciano: An Unknown Work by Michelozzo,” *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte* 28 (1965), 7.

64. This configuration seems to reflect Salvetti’s description of the Orange Cloister in which he claims that “a most sacred oratory is to be seen at the entrance of the lower cloister.” Salvetti, “Gometti Vita,” fol. 5v–6 (see n. 14). The wording of Salvetti’s description is, however, quite vague, and he could be referring to the chapel that once stood adjacent to the chapter room that was eventually endowed by the Del Caccia family. For more on the oratory that once opened off of the southern loggia and its possible Medici patronage, see Piero Sanpaulesi, “Costruzioni del primo quattrocento nella Badia Fiorentina,” *Rivista d’Arte*, 2nd ser., 24, no. 3–4 (1942), 143–79; and Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 166–74.

65. Vasari attributed the St. Benedict lunette to Fra Angelico in both the 1550 and 1568 editions of his *Vite*. Giorgio Vasari, *Le vite de’ più eccellenti pittori scultori e architettori nelle redazioni del 1550 e 1568*, text ed. Rosanna Bettarini, commentary ed. Paola Barocchi, vol. 3, *Testo* (Florence, 1966), 276, 272. For more on the lunette and its attribution, see Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 233–45. An attribution of the lunette’s design to Fra Angelico seems fairly certain based on the style of its underdrawing and comparisons of the composition to similar lunettes painted in the early 1440s at San Marco. An attribution of its completion in paint, however, is more complicated. On 10 and 17 December 1443, the Badia settled its account with a distributor of blue pigment for the purchase of two ounces of azurite for this fresco. Whether this was for completion, a touch up, or a repair cannot be determined. One can be certain that the amount of painting done at this time was minor, given the small amount of pigment purchased, and that it was done *a secco* since azurite cannot be applied to fresh plaster. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 77, “Debitori e Creditori, Bianco C, 1441–1450,” fol. 237 right. For a discussion of the second of these two payments that interprets it as a reference to a necessary repair, see Sara Bonavoglia, “Ricordi precoci del luminismo di Jan van Eyck a Firenze. Alcuni documenti per João Gonçalves e il chiostro degli Aranci,” *Arte Documento* 12 (1998), 64, 68 n. 24, 71.

66. “And let absolute silence be kept at table.” *St. Benedict’s Rule for Monasteries*, ch. 38, 56 (see n. 20). For the original location of the mural overdoor, see Giorgio Vasari, *Le vite de’ più eccellenti pittori scultori e architettori*, ed. Paolo della Pergola, Luigi Grassi, and Giovanni Previtali (Milan, 1962), 2: 395; and Puccinelli, *Cronica*, 3–4.

67. A nineteenth-century plan of unspecified date shows the Orange Cloister and refectory before the corridor was cut through. Archivio di Stato, Museo di Firenze com’era (hereafter AMFCE), Arch. top., 9, inserto D, 345, “Pianta del Monastero soppresso dei Monaci Cassinensi detto la Badia esistente nella Città di Firenze nel terzo Sestiere, Tavola I, Piano Terreno,” pen and ink on paper, 443 x 605 cm. A second plan by Niccolò Nasi dated 10 February 1865 shows the refectory cut through with the corridor. “Progetto di riduzione del Convento di Badia ad uso della Tesoreria,” AMFCE, Arch. top., 9, inserto D, 347.

68. The late-sixteenth-century “Ricordi della Badia” states that the refectory was elongated in 1515. Girolamo da Perugia, “Ricordi della Badia,” fol. 19v (see n. 8). According to Vasari, Giovanni Antonio Sogliani decorated the south end wall of the refectory with a fresco depicting Christ on the Cross with the Virgin, and Ss. John, Benedict, and Scholastica, which

is now lost. Vasari, *Vite*, ed. Della Pergola, 4: 395. The fresco was visible through the start of the nineteenth century, and traces of it may be underneath layers of whitewash on the original south end wall of the refectory, which is now cut through with two arches and serves as a partition in a shop accessible at 12r via della Condotta.

69. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 20–23, 25, 27, 28, 35, 42a, 44, 66, 80, 85, 86, 88, 90, 93, 107, 128. For an inventory of workshops described as "sotto il dormitorio" (under the dormitory) along Piazza San Firenze (then Apollinare) and via della Condotta (then del Garbo), see Guidotti, "Vicende storico," 178–9 (see n. 1).

70. A payment of 7 September 1437 for work on the stair that went into the old dormitory could refer to one built to connect the old and new dormitories somewhere in the eastern portion of the complex. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 doc. 107.

71. This doorway has been identified as one installed by Bernardo Rossellino on 28 July 1436 by Cornelius von Fabriczy in his "Ein Jugendwerk Bernardo Rossellinos und spätere unbeachtete Schöpfungen seines Meissels," *Jahrbuch der königlich preussischen Kunstsammlungen* 21 (1900), 109; Paatz, *Die Kirchen*, 1: 298 n. 17 (see n. 9); Sanpaulesi, "Costruzioni," 166, app. 1 doc. 21; Nunes, *Gomez*, 260 n. 135 (see n. 12); Anne Markham, "The Sculpture of Bernardo Rossellino and His Workshop" (Ph.D. diss., New York University, 1968), 15; and Mack, "Studies," 47–48, 60 n. 36. However, the document discussed by these scholars mentions a doorway with an arch made of two pieces of stone, and the southeast corner bay doorway has an arch made of three pieces, thus casting doubt that the documented doorway is the one in the second-story loggia: "Da Bernardo di Mateo lastraiuolo uno stipito di macingnio stropicciato e murata a pie della schala va in su il terazo, e piu uno archo di di [sic] dua pezi di macingnio stropicciato murato sopra a detto stipito." ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 1, "Giornale B," fol. 33. Leader, "Florentine Badia," 186 n. 163, app. 1 doc. 84.

72. The records kept by the Badia during and after Abbot Gomezio's reign conform to standard early-fifteenth-century Florentine bookkeeping practices and employ a series of cross-referenced memoranda, journals, and ledgers with debits, credits, and other information recorded in a narrative format. No complete series of the various account books survives, and only a small fraction of the entire series of accounts that would have been kept from 1420 to 1450 is known, as attested by cross-references in the extant records to many other books that are now lost. Had the entire series of account books and corresponding memoranda survived, a much clearer picture of the project would be revealed. For more on the surviving documents, see Leader, "Florentine Badia," 178–80, 371–73.

73. Nunes, *Gomez*, 243–44, postulated that since it took three years to build the upper cloister and dormitory, the same time period could be allotted to the lower cloister and refectory.

74. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 doc. 6.

75. On 6 December 1438, Giovanni d'Antonio was listed as a creditor for 42 lire, money long overdue as payment for work done on the lower cloister prior to 15 July 1430, when Don Pazino was the bookkeeper for the Badia. See n. 60 above and Leader, "Florentine Badia," 180 n. 141, app. 1 doc. 115.

76. Nunes, *Gomez*, 243 n. 6, suggested that this record indicates a completion date of the lower cloister at some time in late 1431 or early 1432. The entry, which has been copied out of an earlier account book, falls between entries dated 29 March and 2 May 1432, and its exact date is difficult to determine. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 310, "Entrate/Uscite 1426–34," fol. 247 [95 o.s.]. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 doc. 38.

77. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 438: 1, "Libro di Debitori e Creditori B, 1431–34" (hereafter "Debitori/Creditori B"). Leader, "Florentine Badia," 180–81, app. 1 docs. 7–36.

78. Antonio di Domenico is referred to in the documents as "maestro," "maestro di murare," "capomaestro," and "capomaestro alla parte." Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 12b, 13, 15, 24, 29. Another master builder, Bartolomeo di Giovanni, received payments from late 1432 throughout 1433, but it is difficult to determine whether he worked on the project from its inception or joined the construction team as the lower story was nearing completion to work on the upper stories of the complex. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 10, 14, 16, 19, 26, 31, 32. Other stoneworkers who received payments in 1434 include Bruogio di Nanni da Fiesole and Francesco del Bozolino. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 438: 1, "Debitori/Creditori B," fols. 10, 40, 43. Nunes, *Gomez*, 262; Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 12, 20, 25.

79. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 438: 1, "Debitori/Creditori B," fol. 2; and ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 310, "Entrate/Uscite 1426–34," fol. 250 [98 o.s.]. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 8, 39.

80. The abbot's quarters included a bedroom, living room, and study. Later documents confirm that the abbot's chambers were upstairs off the upper cloister, and several authors postulate that these were in the area above the church narthex as shown in the Rustici Codex drawing (see Figure 9). Guidotti, "Vicende storico," 73 (see n. 1); Carrara, "Badia Fiorentina," 109 (see n. 12); and Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 9, 17, 18, 33, 130.

81. The stonecutter Ambrogio di Giovanni da Fiesole (Bruogio di Nanni) received a number of payments for worked stone between 9 April and 17 July 1434, including several stone doors "et tre schaglioni a spese del dormitorio nuovo." ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 438:1, "Debitori/Creditori B," fols. 40, 43. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 20, 25.

82. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 doc. 27. For conversion of Florentine dry measurements, see Ronald Edward Zupko, *Italian Weights and Measures from the Middle Ages to the Nineteenth Century*, Memoirs of the American Philosophical Society, 145 (Philadelphia, 1981), 168.

83. "A Bernardo di Matteo lastraiuolo lire quattro portò cantanti disse per dare a un maestro aveva fatto l'arco de l'uscio di dormitorio, lb. 4." ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 1, "Giornale B," fol. 2. For interpretation and history of this document, see Leader, "Florentine Badia," 173 n. 153, app. 1 doc. 42a.

84. For payments related to roofing and vaulting materials, gutters, and lead tie beams for the cloister vaults, see Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 43, 44, 45a, 49b, 52, 54, 57b, 57c, 58a, 58b, 59–61, 63a, 63b, 73, 80, 82, 85. See also Sanpaulesi, "Costruzioni," 154 (see n. 64).

85. Benedetto di Marco da Terra Rossa ran a large kiln within the walls of Florence with his brother Pagolo. Benedetto had a long career in Florence, working on many important commissions and serving the masons' guild as consul twenty times between 1426 and 1471. Richard A. Goldthwaite, *The Building of Renaissance Florence: An Economic and Social History* (Baltimore and London, 1980), 193–95, 279; and Philip Jacks and William Caferro, *The Spinelli of Florence: Fortunes of a Renaissance Merchant Family* (University Park, Penn., 2001), 207–8, 210. On 9 March 1436, another brick-maker, Maso d'Antonio a Monte Buoni, received 5 lire and 5 soldi to settle his account with the Badia. Like the payments to Benedetto di Marco, this also suggests that most brick and mortar deliveries for the cloister and dormitory had been made some time before the start of 1436. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 1, "Giornale B," fol. 8. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 doc. 55.

86. Sanpaulesi, "Costruzioni," 150. The extant "Giornale" is called B, and it records daily payments made between 1 February 1436 and 28 August 1441. It is likely that "Giornale A" would have held records for at least the first half of the 1430s.

87. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 1, "Giornale B," fol. 20v. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 doc. 70a.

88. Leader, "Florentine Badia," 215–29.

89. A doorway connecting the second-story cloister with its surmounting

terrace was delivered by Bernardo Rossellino on 28 July 1436, and gutters for this terrace were installed on 17 October. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 1, "Giornale B," fols. 33, 49v. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 84, 91. See also n. 71 above.

90. Puccinelli and Uccelli dated the *foresteria* to 1444; Paatz argued that the monks only acquired the land on which they built the *foresteria* in 1464 and that it was built in 1477—a hypothesis proven false by the 1441 inventory. Puccinelli, *Cronica*, 48, 61 (see n. 14); Uccelli, *Della Badia*, 63 (see n. 9); and Paatz, *Die Kirchen*, 1: 266 n. 21, 269 n. 282 (see n. 9).

91. Abbot Gomezio was nominated to replace Ambrogio Traversari as general of the Camaldolese order in November 1439. His appointment was made official in December, and he left the Badia in January 1440. Nunes, *Gomez*, 252 (see n. 12).

92. "Let all guests who arrive be received like Christ. . . . And to all let due honor be shown, especially to the domestics of the faith and to pilgrims." *St. Benedict's Rule for Monasteries*, ch. 53, 72 (see n. 20).

93. Payments for furniture and its installation in December 1436 and January 1437 suggest that the dormitory was finished and in use by this time. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 86, 88, 90, 93, 95, 98.

94. A little over 40 1/2 florins (192 lire, 17 soldi) were spent on the *foresteria* in the spring of 1440, of which 60.7 percent was paid to various woodworkers, with the remainder divided among brick-makers, masons, and stoneworkers, and other miscellaneous building expenses. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 1, "Giornale B," fol. 287v–289v, 309v. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 116–22.

95. One bedroom was located in a mezzanine level as indicated by the 1441 inventory: "Foresteria; camera a meza schala allato allo refectorio." ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 386, "Inventarium," fols. 5–5v. Guidotti, "Vicende storico," 172–73 (see n. 1); Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 doc. 130.

96. At the time of the writing of this article, the former guest house and infirmary were occupied by the Hotel Cristina and the offices of the Pretura. The location of these doors and stairs contradicts the theory of Nunes, *Gomez*, 253, who believed the guest house was in the south wing of the complex along via della Condotta. For other theories placing the *foresteria* underneath the dormitory, see Mack, "Studies," 41–42 (see n. 37); and Guidotti, "Vicende storico," 69–70.

97. According to Puccinelli, Abbot Ignazio Franchi bought a tower and houses belonging to the Sacchetti family in 1449 to unite them with the fabric of the monastery "for use and comfort of the sick." Whether these purchases were to complete or expand the infirmary is unclear. Ignazio became abbot in 1440 and held the position several times during the 1440s and 1450s. Thus, it is quite possible that Puccinelli credited the right abbot with the wrong date. The Sacchetti family owned towers and houses along both sides of via del Garbo (della Condotta). Traces of these towers are visible in 18r and 20r via della Condotta, and traces of the original house at 14r and 16r. Puccinelli, *Cronica*, 33–40, 48; Uccelli, *Della Badia*, 40, 63 n. 1; and Loris Macci and Valeria Orgera, *Architettura e civiltà delle torri. Torri e famiglie nella Firenze medievale* (Florence, 1994), 162. Alessandro Guidotti has shown that negotiations with the Sacchetti occurred as early as 1405, and the Benedictines seem to have begun acquiring the Sacchetti property that lay behind the refectory as early as 1429. Guidotti, "Vicende storico," 69, 92 nn. 167–72.

98. Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 docs. 6, 130.

99. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 1, "Giornale B," fol. 38. For a transcription of this document, see Fabriczy, "Jugendwerk," 109 (see n. 71); Sanpaulesi, "Costruzioni," 166, app. 1 doc. 22 (see n. 64); Nunes, *Gomez*, 260 n. 135; and Leader, "Florentine Badia," app. 1 doc. 87. Mack argued that the infirmary was part of the original Orange Cloister project based on this document and that Puccinelli's later dating referred to its completion,

augmentation, or remodeling. Mack, "Studies," 46.

100. Fabriczy, "Jugendwerk," 108–10.

101. ASF, Corp. Rel. Soppr., 78, 1, "Giornale B," fols. 2r–153. Unfortunately, most of the payment records are not specific as to why Rossellino was being paid. He is known also to have made a sacramental tabernacle and to have provided worked stone for the Badia's simultaneous project to renovate its country retreat of S. Maria alle Campora. Therefore, it is difficult to be certain that all of the 56 florins were reimbursement for work on the Orange Cloister.

102. Maryla Tyskiewicz attributed the cloister to Rossellino in her monograph on the sculptor-architect, *Bernardo Rossellino* (Florence, 1928), 25–26, doc. 6, as did Paatz, *Die Kirchen*, 1: 265, 297–98 n. 16. For more on the attribution and critical history of the Orange Cloister, see Leader, "Florentine Badia," 99–125.

103. The notion of eclecticism and personal architectural style in the Early Renaissance needs to be revisited as more building projects are reevaluated in terms of collaborative building practice. Indeed, it seems that architects whose styles are classified as eclectic, like Michelozzo and Rossellino, were in fact members of large teams of builders. Thus the eclecticism should be ascribed as a characteristic of a certain workshop rather than an individual person.

104. Sanpaulesi, "Costruzioni," 154–56.

105. Tyskiewicz, "Il Chiostro degli Aranci," 203–9 (see n. 43). Despite Sanpaulesi's proposals, subsequent references to the Orange Cloister attribute the building to Rossellino.

106. Nunes, *Gomez*, 241–65.

107. The daily journal covers only the years 1436 to 1441. Since the cloister's construction was nearly finished by 1436, this account book provides an incomplete record. Additional documents studied by Nunes broaden the building chronology to start before 1428 and continue through 1441. See Leader, "Florentine Badia," 371–73. Rossellino's year of birth is not known for sure. Anne Markham believes it is either 1407 or 1410, and Charles Mack favors 1409, which would have made Rossellino, at the oldest, twenty-one when construction of the cloister began. It seems unlikely that Abbot Gomezio would have entrusted his renovation to such a young and untested stoneworker. Markham, "Sculpture of Rossellino," 7 (see n. 71); and Mack, "Studies," 423. Rossellino is documented at the Misericordia Palace in 1433. 108. Those who accept the dual attribution to Rossellino and Antonio di Domenico include Saalman, "Palazzo Comunale," 3–8, 29–31, 44–46 (see n. 63); Markham, "Sculpture of Rossellino," 5–81, esp. 15 n. 28; Mack, "Studies," 34–61; Ludwig H. Heydenreich and Wolfgang Lotz, *Architecture in Italy, 1400–1600*, The Pelican History of Art, ed. Nikolaus Pevsner and Judy Nairn, trans. Mary Hottinger (Harmondsworth and Baltimore, 1974), 42; Guidotti, "Vicende storico," 68–69 (see n. 1); Busignani and Bencini, *Chiese di Firenze*, 176, 190 (see n. 10); Castelli, *Chiostri di Firenze*, 16–20 (see n. 10); Hood, *Fra Angelico*, 130, 136, 312 nn. 30, 32 (see n. 5); Alessandra Anselmi, "Bernardo Rossellino. 2. Architecture," in Jane Turner, ed., *The Dictionary of Art*, vol. 27 (London, 1996), 181–82; and Jacks and Caferro, *Spinelli*, 184 (see n. 85). For a more descriptive discussion of the Orange Cloister's critical fortune, see Leader, "Florentine Badia," 99–125. 109. Mack, "Studies," 46.

110. See Goldthwaite, *Building of Renaissance Florence*, esp. 124–30, 137–47, 157–66, 351–96 (see n. 85). See also Harriet McNeal, "Workshops and Partnerships in Renaissance Sculpture," in Steven Bule et al., eds., *Verrocchio and Late Quattrocento Italian Sculpture* (Florence, 1992), 357–73. Nikolaus Pevsner, "The Term 'Architect' in the Middle Ages," *Speculum* 17 (Oct. 1942), 549–62; James S. Ackerman, "Architectural Practice in the Italian Renaissance," *JSAH* 13 (Oct. 1954), 3–11; Leopold D. Ettlinger, "The Emergence of the Architect during the Fifteenth Century," in Spiro Kostof,

ed., *The Architect: Chapters in the History of the Profession* (New York, 1977), 96–123; Goldthwaite, *Building of Renaissance Florence*, 351–96; Mary Hollingsworth, “The Architect in Fifteenth-Century Florence,” *Art History* 7 (Dec. 1984), 385–406; E. V. Lucas-Libor, “The Ospedale de San Matteo, 1385–1410” (Ph.D. diss., University of Essex, 1988), 299–302; McNeal, “Workshops and Partnerships,” 357–59; Marvin Trachtenberg, “Michelozzo and the Pazzi Chapel,” *Casabella* 642 (Feb. 1997), 58, 60; and Jacks and Caferro, *Spinelli*, 117, 194–202, 206–7.

111. These craftsmen are referred to in the documents as “maestri du murare,” “manovali,” “lastraiuoli,” and “scarpellatori.” Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 181.

112. For example, in the 1470s and 1480s, the Opera di Santo Spirito employed two *capomaestri* in this manner, and a similar collaboration may have taken place at the Orange Cloister. Hollingsworth, “Architect,” 387.

113. Girolamo da Perugia, “Ricordi della Badia,” fol. 14 (see n. 8).

114. Giovanni d’Antonio’s *estimo* of 1435 lists Santa Maria Nuova and the Opera di San Giovanni as each owing his firm 8 florins, thus suggesting that Giovanni and his brothers were working for these and other major institutions during the 1430s. ASF, Catasto, 578, fol. 307. See also Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 198–200. In his biography of Giuliano da Maiano, Vasari identifies Giuliano’s father as a stonecutter who had a shop in Florence for the sale of dressed stone. Since Giuliano’s father, Nardo, was matriculated as a *legnaiuolo*, or woodworker, it seems plausible that Vasari was unwittingly referring to the stonecutter Giovanni d’Antonio, Giuliano’s uncle.

115. See n. 110.

116. Mary Hollingsworth has argued the futility of continuing to scour through a building’s documentary and visual evidence to identify a single architect, and she debunks the “rigid definitions of the roles of patron, designer, and supervisor” that obscure collaborative workshop practice. Hollingsworth, “Architect,” 405.

117. The first set of contracts for the Ospedale degli Innocenti was drawn up in 1419 and work continued over the next decade; the complex was mostly finished by 1432. However, the hospital opened its doors only in 1445. A nearly complete set of records survives for the first phase of the hospital’s construction, which lasted through 1432. See Goldthwaite, *Building of Renaissance Florence*, 162–63 n. 69.

118. Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 192–96. This type of naming seems to have been prevalent in fifteenth-century Florence. For example, Michelozzo was referred to as “Michelozzo di Bartolomeo, maestro della muraglia di Palagio” in the 1457 tax declaration of Antonio di Giovanni della Luna. Jacks and Caferro, *Spinelli*, 115 n. 93.

119. In 1422, Antonio was hired as an assessor for the Ospedale degli Inno-

centi, and he was paid on 10 March for evaluations and estimates made to settle builders’ accounts as “Antonio di Domenico capomaestro della parte guelfa.” Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 194 n. 186.

120. For more detailed discussion of Antonio and Giovanni as codirectors of the cloister project as well as supporting documentary evidence, see Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 190–205.

121. For more on Cosimo de’Medici’s interest in the Badia as a patronage opportunity, see Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 166–74.

122. Salvetti, “Gometii Vita,” fols. 5v–6 (see n. 14).

123. Dale Kent, *Cosimo de’Medici and the Florentine Renaissance: The Patron’s Oeuvre* (New Haven, 2000), 90, 171–72, 218–19, 354–57. See also Crispin Robinson, “The Early Medici and Architecture,” in Francis Ames-Lewis, ed., *The Early Medici and Their Artists* (London, 1995), 54–55.

124. San Marco had belonged to the Sylvestrines, a Benedictine reform congregation, who were evicted in January 1436 to make way for a congregation of Observant Dominicans. The Dominicans had forced the removal of the Sylvestrines with the help of Pope Eugenius IV and Cosimo de’Medici. For more on the expulsion, see Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 171–73.

125. For more on the similarities between the Badia’s refectory overdoor and those of San Marco, see Leader, “Florentine Badia,” 233–45.

126. Winkelmes, “Form and Reform,” 61–84 (see n. 4).

127. First, reform ideals would be spread to a convent by “colonists” trained at a reformed house. Next, new disciples would be recruited, followed by a renovation of the monastic living quarters. Lastly, in the cases of the institutions studied by Winkelmes, a new church would be designed. Winkelmes, “Form and Reform,” 64.

128. This pattern was not limited to Benedictine houses but occurred repeatedly throughout Italy as monastic groups would adopt a reformed lifestyle to be followed by an architectural renovation. Winkelmes, “Form and Reform,” 61.

Illustration Credits

Figures 1, 2, 10–15, 17–24, 26–28, 30–31. Photographs by the author

Figures 3–5. Author’s drawings after Middeldorf and Paatz, “Die gotische Badia,” 506, fig. 10

Figure 6. Soprintendenza per i Beni Ambientali e Architettonici, Gabinetto Fotografico, Florence, No. 162635

Figure 16. Archivio Opera del Duomo di Santa Maria del Fiore, Florence

Figure 25. Soprintendenza per il Polo Museale Fiorentino, Florence, No. 109661

Figure 29. Photograph by Marvin Trachtenberg